

**SFO Airport/Community Roundtable  
Meeting No. 283 Overview  
Wednesday, December 5, 2012**

**I. Call to Order / Roll Call / Declaration of Quorum Present**

Roundtable Chairperson Jeffrey Gee called the Regular Meeting of the SFO Airport/Community Roundtable to order, at approximately 7:00 PM, in the David Chetcuti Community Room at Millbrae City Hall. James A. Castañeda, AICP, Roundtable Coordinator called the roll. A quorum (at least 12 Regular Members) was present as follows:

**REGULAR MEMBERS PRESENT**

**John L. Martin**, City and County of San Francisco Airport Commission  
**Julian Chang**, City and County of San Francisco Mayor's Office  
**Dave Pine**, County of San Mateo Board of Supervisors  
**Richard Newman**, C/CAG Airport Land Use Committee (ALUC)  
**Elizabeth Lewis**, Town of Atherton  
**Sepi Richardson, Vice Chairperson**, City of Brisbane  
**Ray Buenaventura**, City of Daly City  
**Naomi Patridge**, City of Half Moon Bay  
**Larry May**, Town of Hillsborough  
**Sue Digre**, City of Pacifica  
**Ann Wengert**, Town of Portola Valley  
**Jeffrey Gee, Chairperson**, City of Redwood City  
**Pedro Gonzalez**, City of South San Francisco  
**David Burow**, Town of Woodside

**REGULAR MEMBERS ABSENT**

City and County of San Francisco Board of Supervisors (Vacant)  
Town of Atherton  
City of Belmont  
City of Burlingame  
City of Foster City  
City of Menlo Park  
City of Millbrae  
City of San Bruno  
City of San Carlos  
City of San Mateo (Vacant)

**ADVISORY MEMBERS PRESENT**

**- Airline/Flight Operations**

**Michael Jones**, United Airlines  
**Glen Morse**, United Airlines

**- Federal Aviation Administration**

**David Dodd**, Manager – Northern California TRACON

**ROUNDTABLE STAFF**

**James A. Castañeda, AICP**, Roundtable Coordinator  
**Cindy Gibbs**, Roundtable Support (Consultant)  
**Harvey Hartmann**, Roundtable Support (Consultant)

## **SAN FRANCISCO INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT STAFF**

**John Bergener**, Planning and Environment

**Bert Ganoung**, Noise Abatement Manager

**Ara Balian**, Noise Abatement Specialist

**John Hampel**, Noise Abatement Specialist

### **II. Public Comments of Items Not on the Agenda**

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** None.

### **III. Consent Agenda Items**

**A.** Review of Airport Director's Report for September 2012

**B.** Review of Airport Director's Report for October 2012

**C.** Review of SFO Fly Quiet Report Q3 2012

**D.** Review of Roundtable Regular Meeting Overview for October 3, 2012

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** None

**Action:** Julian Chang **MOVED** the approval of the Consent Agenda Items. The motion was **SECONDED** by Richard Newman and **CARRIED** with twelve in favor, one abstention by City of South San Francisco.

### **IV.A. Adoption of Resolution 12-07 to Recognize Mike McCarron for His Service as Director for the Bureau of Community Affairs for San Francisco International Airport**

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** Chairman Gee presented Mike McCarron with a Resolution commending him on his work with SFO and involvement with the Roundtable. Mike McCarron thanked the Roundtable, as well as John Martin and the staff of the Noise Abatement Office. Mr. McCarron expressed that it had been a pleasure working with and being involved with the Roundtable. Airport Director John Martin took a moment to further thank Mr. McCarron for his outstanding work.

**Action:** Julian Chang **MOVED** the approval of the Consent Agenda Items. The motion was **SECONDED** by Dave Pine and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY.**

### **IV.B. Airport Director's Report**

Airport Director John Martin introduced Doug Yakel as acting Public Information officer for SFO. Mr. Martin indicated that a meeting was held recently with the Chief pilots for United Airlines, Virgin America, and Southwest Airlines which also included the FAA and Roundtable Chairman Gee to discuss and brainstorm on ways to reduce significant noise issues. It's anticipated that this group will meet three times a year to continue to discuss ideas on noise issues.

Mr. Martin discussed how the SFO Noise Abatement Office is working with the Port of Oakland's Noise Abatement Office in addressing the FedEx flight that utilizes the Oceanic arrival over Woodside late in the evening. Mr. Martin indicated that the Noise Abatement Office is continuing to follow-up with every flight that does not comply with the Shoreline departure procedure. He

provided an update on the portable noise monitoring equipment: quarterly updates were completed with the equipment deployed in Belmont and San Carlos; monitoring equipment will soon be deployed in Millbrae and Woodside.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** Roundtable Vice-chairperson Sepi Richardson requested that future meetings with chief pilots and FAA regarding noise issues include the Vice-chair of the Roundtable. Vice-chair Richardson also inquired of the follow-up procedure with pilots who don't fly the appropriate departure procedures. Mr. Martin briefly explained that the Noise Abatement Office contacts the chief pilot of the airline, who then discusses the situation with the actual pilot of the flight.

Mr. Martin also stated that the Virgin America has canceled future orders for aircrafts. It's expected that intense fare and service competition between the airlines to subside, and should result in reduced domestic traffic growth.

#### **IV.C. Introduction of Technical Consultants to the Roundtable**

Chairman Gee introduced Cindy Gibbs and Harvey Hartman as the Roundtable's new aviation technical consultants. Cindy Gibbs provided an overview of her current work with BridgeNet International. Mr. Hartman's background and expertise is in air traffic control. Mr. Hartman took a moment to introduce himself, and expressed two goals to achieve with the Roundtable; first to facilitate coordination between the Roundtable and Oakland Noise Forum to discuss similar noise issues, and second to answer technical questions regarding the FAA and air traffic control.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** None.

#### **V.A. SFO Construction Update & Departure/Arrival affects**

Bert Ganoung provided an overview of the runway construction website set up to provide details and upcoming construction notices. Chairman Gee discussed the need to provide the Noise Abatement Office with the contact information for individual city's notifications systems, and asked staff to look into this effort.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** None.

#### **V.B. Update on FAA's PORTE THREE Departure Analysis**

Chairman Gee provide a brief background on the drafting process and the intentions of soliciting input to incorporate in a future draft to be considered at the February meeting. Member Julian Chang thanked Chairman Gee for taking the lead on the letters and praised the thoughtful approach. Several members pointed out that letter was not included in the packet. Roundtable Coordinator James Castañeda explained that the letter was accidentally omitted from the packet due to an oversight during the packet's production.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** Member Rich Newman expressed concern in referencing Senator Eshoo's letter as the "Eshoo Agreement" to avoid codifying the letter, and cautioning proposing use of alternative noise measuring matrices and applying different standards to current established noise matrices. Chairman Gee reviewed the themes included in the letter, which were to 1) encourage use of the PORTE departure procedure in its entirety, 2) ask the Noise Abatement Office staff to continue working with the airlines to program cockpits with the correct

procedure, 3) continue to educate controllers to be sensitive of noise concerns, 4) advocate coordination between SFO and OAK departures, when feasible, to avoid shortening the PORTE departure, and 5) acknowledge Metroplex as possibly providing relief in the long term due to the use of efficient airspace utilization, which in turn could result in less congestion.

### **V.C. Update on the Crossing Altitude of Oceanic Arrivals Over the Woodside VOR**

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** John Martin indicated he would be providing edits to the draft letter acknowledge the work the FAA and airlines have done thus far, and to encourage them to continue engaging the Roundtable. It was also suggested to change the use of “Eshoo Agreement” to “Eshoo Letter” and include a copy of said letter to avoid confusion. Member Elizabeth Lewis commended Chairman Gee for taking the initiative to summarize the issues in the letters. She pointed out the Woodside noise issue had been recently featured recently in the town almanac and various blogs.

Woodside resident Jim Lyons expressed concern over the letter’s discussion of Oceanic Tailored Arrivals (OTA) which account for 4% of the flights over the Woodside VOR. While the letter makes effort to address the OTAs, the other 96% of flights are not addressed. He urged that the letter address those flights as well, and in a way that does not compromise the position he and his colleagues have argued in maintaining Senator Eshoo’s 2005 agreement of flights no lower than 8,000 feet at the Woodside VOR, regardless of OTA or otherwise. Mr. Lyons reiterated that the letter needs to be drafted to consider 100% of the flights. Woodside resident Victor Schachter stated that he’s still waiting for a response from the FAA in regards to hearing the noise issue of the community and take into consideration. He requested that the letter be crafted in the most persuasive manner to request specific environmental review regarding noise. Mr. Schachter then read excerpts from the article mentioned by Member Lewis, highlighting comments from retired pilots. Woodside resident Tina Nguyen asked how many flights will be routed through the Woodside VOR as a result of NextGEN. Roundtable technical consultant Harvey Hartmann explained that nothing has been developed regarding revised procedures as a result of NextGEN. Bert Ganoung added that the NextGEN will initially be an overlay of current procedures. Member Newman stated his concern about the Roundtable discouraging the use of the OTAs and should be discussed further.

Chairman Gee encouraged members to provide additional comments and send those to staff.

### **V.D. Follow-up on Optimization of Airspace & Procedures in Metroplex (OAMP)**

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** Vice-chair Sepi Richardson commended the good work of those involved, and expressed that while she supports the airlines in being successful, she has been patient in regards to having the community’s needs heard. She expressed that Roundtable has had a legacy of accomplishments, and should return to such. Concern was raised regarding the reference of the Roundtable’s MOU in the letters, specifically regarding the avoidance of noise shift issues Vice-chair Richardson urged that the MOU be revisited to discuss this statement, as it’s agreed that no noise shifting should occur in San Mateo County, but to start talking about shifting noise to San Francisco. Julian Chang voiced appreciation for Vice-chair’s passion, but did not find her suggestions acceptable. Mr. Chang expressed that this is not a zero-sum situation and as seen in the FAA’s presentation in October, the routing of aircraft is a complex situation. Mr. Chang added that the Roundtable needs to take an advocacy role that needs to be both effective and creditable given the group’s limited jurisdiction and influence. Vice-chair Richardson followed-up by indicating that San Mateo County can only take so much, and if the excessive noise cannot be address for the reason that airspace is limited, then maybe San Francisco needs

to have noise placed over it as it has been placed over San Mateo County's cities. It was suggested by the Vice-chair to remove the last paragraph regarding the Roundtable's MOU.

Woodside resident Jim Lyons briefly commented that intent of the letter should follow that of Senator Boxer's letter included in the October 2012 Roundtable packet. Pacifica resident Molly Muller reported on the increased low and loud aircrafts she has witnessed since September. She provided photographs to illustrate how low they've been flying.

#### **V.E. Adoption of 2013 Roundtable Meeting Dates**

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** Roundtable Coordinator James Castañeda provided a brief overview of the meeting dates. Vice-chair Richardson and member Elizabeth Lewis corrected dates indicated on the memo in the packet.

**Action:** Vice-chair Richardson **MOVED** adoption of the 2013 Roundtable Meeting Dates. The motion was **SECONDED** by Naomi Patridge and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY**.

#### **VI. Member Communications /Announcements**

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** None.

#### **VII. Adjourn**

The meeting was adjourned in memory of former San Mateo County Board of Supervisor Mike Neven at approximately 8:39 PM.