

Airport / Community Roundtable
Meeting No. 279 Overview
Wednesday, March 7, 2012

I. Call to Order / Roll Call / Declaration of Quorum Present

Chairperson Gee called the Regular Meeting of the Airport/Community Roundtable to order, at approximately 7:17 PM, at the SFO Airport. Steve Alverson, Roundtable Chairperson called the roll. A quorum (at least 12 Regular Members) was not present.

REGULAR MEMBERS PRESENT

Julian L. Chang, Mayor's Office Representative
Mike McCarron, San Francisco International Airport (Alternate)
Dave Pine, County of San Mateo Board of Supervisors
Elizabeth Lewis, Town of Atherton
Sepi Richardson, City of Brisbane/**Vice-Chairperson**
Larry May, Town of Hillsborough
Robert Gottschalk, City of Millbrae
Sue Digre, City of Pacifica
Jeffrey Gee, City of Redwood City/**Chairperson**
Ken Ibarra, City of San Bruno
David Burow, Town of Woodside

REGULAR MEMBERS ABSENT

City and County of San Francisco Board of Supervisors (Vacant)
C/CAG Airport Land Use Committee (ALUC)
City of Belmont
City of Burlingame
City of Foster City
City of Half Moon Bay
City of Menlo Park
Town of Portola Valley
City of San Carlos
City of San Mateo (Vacant)
City of South San Francisco

ADVISORY MEMBERS

Airline/Flight Operations

Glen Morse, United Airlines

Federal Aviation Administration

Dennis Green, Nor Cal TRACON
David Dodd, David Norris

ROUNDTABLE STAFF / CONSULTANTS

Steve Alverson, Roundtable Coordinator
Phil Wade, Roundtable Support

SAN FRANCISCO INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT STAFF

Mike McCarron, Director Bureau of Community Affairs
John Bergener, Director of Planning
Bert Ganoung, Noise Abatement Manager
David Ong, Sr. Noise Abatement Systems Manager
Ara Balian, Noise Abatement Specialist
John Hampel, Noise Abatement Specialist

Steve Alverson welcomed the attendees. He noted process for parking validation. He also informed the attendees that there were only three microphones, and asked members to ask for the microphone when they wanted to speak.

Chairperson Gee noted that this is one of the meetings that were added to the Roundtable schedule, and noted that the Chetcuti Community Meeting Room in Millbrae was not available for this evening's meeting, which is why the meeting was being held at the SFO Aviation Museum. Chairperson Gee thanked SFO for making the meeting space available.

II. Public Comment on Items NOT on the Agenda

Chairperson Gee opened the floor to public comments on items not on the agenda. There were no requests for comments, so the public comment period was closed.

III. Consent Agenda Items

Chairperson Gee noted that since there was not a quorum, the Roundtable could not vote on the consent agenda items or any other matters until a quorum was present.

IV. Airport Director's Report

Mike McCarron, who was filling in for Airport Director John Martin, noted that SFO is having a good year, and that the numbers are strong and just short of record passenger levels. SFO is experiencing its best year since 2000, and 2012 is looking even better than 2011. Airlines are adding service. He indicated that Department of Transportation is going to open slots to National Airport in Washington, DC. United Airlines was granted one of these slots and will start flying from SFO to National.

Questions/Comments: None.

V. FY 2011-2012 Roundtable Work Program Items

V.A Update on FAA's PORTE THREE Departure Analysis

Chairperson Gee noted that they tried to restructure the agenda to allow more discussion and work. The agenda is now geared towards less reporting and more action-oriented discussions.

Chairperson Gee opened Item V.A describing noise issues in Brisbane. He stated that last October there was a community noise workshop in Brisbane and in January, a meeting with Congresswoman Speier. Congresswoman Speier sent a letter to FAA Regional Administrator William Withycombe. Withycombe responded with a letter to the Congresswoman. In addition, the Roundtable sent a letter to FAA requesting the analysis of alternatives to the PORTE THREE departure, and FAA responded that they would be studying the submittal. He noted that the letters were included in the meeting agenda packet.

Chairperson Gee also noted that Dennis Green has replaced Patty Daniel on the Roundtable as FAA's representative of the Northern California TRACON, while Patty is working on the Northern California Metroplex Airspace Optimization project.

Dennis Green noted that FAA had been studying the alternatives, and their work should be done next week. They are scheduled to meet with Congresswoman Speier in early April to review the results. Gee asked if they would know more at the next Roundtable meeting.

Peter Grace, resident of Brisbane, addressed the Roundtable on this item. He stated that the goal of this talk to highlight the tools available through SFO noise. He noted that there are lots of complaints in Brisbane. He asked the Roundtable to look beyond the complaints, and look at what's happening on the ground. Every flight is tracked every 4.7 seconds. There are a series of noise monitors around the Bay. SFO Noise Abatement has the tools to match flights, tracks, and noise events. The first sheet in packet shows data from October 5, 2011 of flights coming from R01L between 6 am and 6:55 am and 1 pm and 2 pm. Flights that made noise events in Brisbane are coded in red. Any flight recording more than 65 dB on a Brisbane noise monitor is shown as red flights. White flights did not produce a level above 65 dB. There were six flights on October 5, 2011; five of which created a noise event. He believes this is a typical day and he is personally woken up by these flights. He said, how many times do I need to call to let you know there is a problem? He said he has never called, but sent emails. He has given up on emailing. This is a regular problem every morning; flights coming straight over Brisbane.

He explained the second page of his handout shows most of the flights are white. A couple flights flew to the four mile marker and then turned. Between 1 pm and 2 pm, there were 11 flights, two of which created noise events. The rest flew to the four-mile marker and did not create a noise event. He said he has asked the FAA why these flights are turning early. Mr. Grace said he has asked SFO Noise Abatement why the 7 am flights turn before the four-mile marker, but has not received. He asked the Roundtable to ask SFO Noise Abatement staff to provide him with a response on why the flights are turning before the four-mile marker.

He summed up by saying that there are tools available beyond noise complaints. This analysis came as a result of speaking with SFO Noise Abatement staff. He suggested that other communities would probably appreciate a noise analysis like his that matches the flights with the noise levels.

Questions/Comments: Vice-Chairperson Sepi Richardson added that Brisbane is asking for aircraft to fly to the four-mile marker, and it's resulting in a loss of quality of life, and they want to work with SFO on this issue.

Member Ken Ibarra asked if they can get an update on where things are at in terms of an explanation from FAA. Is there any explanation, or is it an issue coordination and

cooperation in terms of taking the flight path. He didn't want to point fingers, but he felt the Roundtable has not received an answer.

FAA NCT Representative Dennis Green introduced David Dodd and David Norris who are also with the FAA. He stated that the PORTE THREE is a non-radar departure. There is a lot of traffic in the area, and what you are seeing is our effort to move aircraft safely and efficiently.

Peter Grace asked, why does it happen between 6 am and 7 am. He stated that interference with flights to OAK isn't the reason. He believes he is being told things that are not completely true. Mr. Grace said planes are being vectored earlier, and the FAA is not looking at the communities it's affecting.

Brian Perkins from Congresswoman Speier's office stated that he appreciated Mr. Grace's diagrams. He noted that with respect to the upcoming April meeting, Congresswoman Speier expects to hear solutions at the meeting. Mr. Perkins asked that charting the flights that are causing noise events need to be charted so you can identify the issues or conflicts. He stated that he believes this is just a "common" practice, which is why it should be implemented.

Vice- Chairperson Sepi Richardson noted that there have been two meetings with Congresswoman Speier, and you would not believe the FAA has no answers. She felt it was unprofessional for the FAA to walk into the meetings with Congresswoman Speier with no answers.

Chairperson Gee noted that he is hopeful that by the April meeting at Congresswoman Speier's office that FAA will present possible solutions. He thanked the FAA for being at the Roundtable meeting tonight, and noted that they support the FAA's mission and the communities' noise concern.

V.B Update on the Crossing Altitude of Oceanic Arrivals Over the Woodside VOR

Chairperson Gee noted that an ad hoc committee was formed at the February 1, 2012 Roundtable meeting to address the Woodside issue.

Member David Burow reported that the ad hoc committee had met and interacted with the SFO Noise Abatement Office. The requests made by Mr. Jim Lyons at the February 1, 2012 meeting were: 1. Data from SFO, which will be made available to him. (This request was completed, brought in on CD and handed to Mr. Lyons after meeting); 2. Noise monitoring equipment be placed at the Woodside VOR. (A portable noise monitor was installed on March 5th at two locations near the Woodside VOR. The plan is to report monthly on single-event noise exposure levels two weeks after the end of the month. Report is expected around the 15th or 16th of the next four months. A report will be generated at the end of the project on the CNEL for the area and single event levels. The committee is looking at installing a permanent noise monitor to monitor NEXTGEN and other issues. The committee is looking at funding alternatives and asked that they be made aware of any grant opportunities. The committee asked Steve Alverson to inform them of grants if available or to add money to the Roundtable budget to fund this, or cost sharing options.) 3. Request TRACON to state they intend to comply with the ESHOO agreement and comply with NCT7110.65P. The committee understands that Mr. Lyons met with Congresswoman Eshoo and a letter was sent to the FAA.

Questions/Comments: Member Elizabeth Lewis added that Member Wengert recommended the installation of the portable monitors at a private residence for security, as well as it was a site used for previous noise monitoring efforts to benchmark noise levels. She said she appreciates the FAA and SFO's responsiveness on this issue.

Chairperson Gee thanked Member David Burow and the ad hoc committee for their work on this issue.

Mr. Lyons addressed the Roundtable, starting by thanking Bert Ganoung, SFO Noise Abatement office, FAA, and the ad hoc committee for their responsiveness. He said he believes that the data will show an impact on citizens in Woodside and Portola Valley. Mr. Lyons reported on a meeting with Congresswoman Eshoo on February 10, 2012 in Palo Alto. She was receptive towards Mr. Lyons' concerns about noise from aircraft, and believed she had reached an agreement with FAA and SFO regarding minimum altitudes over the Woodside VOR, and she wanted to know why this agreement was not being followed. She sent letter on February 15, 2012, requesting a meeting with John Martin and members of FAA. He was not aware of a response yet. He also noted that the FAA responded to his letter concerning the "Eshoo Agreement." Mr. Lyons stated that Mr. Withycombe stated there's no record of an agreement with Congresswoman Eshoo. Mr. Withycombe takes the position that NCT711065T, only applies, traffic permitting, to oceanic arrivals, which is a small portion of total flights over the Woodside VOR. In Mr. Withycombe's view, this provision is being complied with. Mr. Lyons stated this is strange because there is one United Airlines flight that flies over at 4:30 in the morning, and 70% are below 7,000 feet and 30% are below 6,000 feet. He said he is looking forward to a response to this issue. He also noted the materials/flight data that was made available to him from the SFO Noise Abatement Office should be made available on the website.

Chairperson Gee said he would work with Staff on adding this data to the website. He asked if there would be a follow-up meeting with Congresswoman Eshoo.

V.C Review/approval of an Interim Roundtable Budget Expenditures for FY 2011/2012

Member Dave Pine opened this item by stating the budget ad hoc committee met, and he had done a lot of up-front work. The SFO Roundtable is not a standalone entity, and does everything through other agencies. Any contract we enter into is through San Mateo County, and payments are administered through the County.

He stated that since there has been no internal staffing at the County since Dave Carbone and Connie Shields left, all the day-to-day things have ground to a halt.

In the prior fiscal year, Member Pine stated that there was an expense of \$148,000 with revenues of \$150,000, and as the Roundtable entered in to the new fiscal year, a budget was not adopted. The biggest ramification of losing County staff was pushing all the work to ESA. Workload went up at the same time. ESA has done a lot of work for the Roundtable over the past nine months, and at this point, ESA is our only source of support.

On the revenue side, we receive \$125,000 from SFO, \$6,000 from the County. The cities are not paying anything this year, because in FY 2010, it was agreed the fees should be cut in half, but everyone was billed in full last year. So no fees are being paid this year. Traditionally the fee has been \$1500 per city. Total revenue is \$131,000. Expenditures: 1.

Reimburse the County for Dave Carbone and Connie Shields (\$21,000). 2. To date, ESA has billed \$135,000, and projected amounts need to be explored. Remaining balance could not pay ESA. Ad hoc needs to work with ESA and SFO, as SFO may be able to bridge this period.

The ad hoc Budget Committee understands where we are now, and have a lot of follow-up to make sure the books are balanced. It is impossible to charge the cities any additional funds. We are close to resolving this issue, but need additional discussion with ESA and SFO. In the packet there is a document that is the agreement between the City of San Francisco and San Mateo County where the City gives the County \$125,000 for it to spend on behalf of the Roundtable. That document needed to be put in place for the FY. No action on this item is needed. The ad hoc committee has a deeper understanding of these issues. We are now in the implementation phase. Member Pine stated that he is not sure if the Roundtable can adopt a budget.

Chairperson Gee noted that there is not a quorum, so there can be no vote on the budget.

Questions/Comments: Vice-Chairperson Sepi Richardson thanked Member Pine for the committee's work and asked if the \$135,000 for ESA was through what period. Member Pine stated that it was for all invoices through January 2012. Pine noted that if the current run rate continued, it's about \$21,000 a month, for a total of \$250,000. Vice-Chairperson Richardson stated that the Roundtable cannot continue to spend money at this rate, and the County needs to draft a job description in order to hire a dedicated person who has knowledge and expertise in aviation to take on this work. She stated that the Roundtable started at \$2,500 a month, and is now going to \$21,000 a month.

Chairperson Gee noted that prior years actually averaged about \$5,000 a month, or about \$60K a year. He noted that there was no backfill for Dave Carbone and Connie Shields' departure, and ESA did a good job filling in for them. There is no question that the current model is not financially sustainable and that the Roundtable needs to find a way to reduce cost, or find new revenue sources, or disperse responsibilities. He said that this needs to happen for the new fiscal year. Chairperson Gee thanked Member Pine and the other ad hoc members. Member Julian Chang noted that the fiscal year for the City of SF started July 1.

Bert Ganoung noted that SFO is the author of the contract. Bert noted that the County would not sign the contract.

Member Pine stated that the agreement is in order, and has always been for one year. He stated there is no way the County could have a multi-year agreement with the City of San Francisco.

Steve Alverson added that the membership voted to reduce the number of meetings, which is what ESA's \$60,000 annual contract was based on. When Dave Carbone retired and the Roundtable office closed, ESA took on those duties expecting a change in our contract scope or budget. ESA took on those extra tasks and did everything we could to keep things running smoothly. The Roundtable voted to double the number of meetings. He noted that Connie Shields is still interested in supporting the Roundtable, and just couldn't because there were not enough hours available to her under the reduced meeting schedule. ESA is happy to support the Roundtable at any level or manner necessary.

Member Pine stated that ESA has done a lot of good work. The current model is just not sustainable. This isn't meant to reflect badly on ESA. They stepped in where needed and got the work done.

Sue Digre spoke up on behalf of the ad hoc committee that San Mateo County should hire an aviation planner, so the Roundtable can move forward as intended.

Member Pine noted that the structure was very complex. Dave Carbone was paid by yet another entity. Going forward, the Roundtable will be more diligent. Dave's vacancy lies with CCAG and not the County.

Chairperson Gee thanked Member Pine again for his work. Based on the work that has been done, we have a path forward to get our house in order, and will require more conversations with County, CCAG, and to ask for more money. There is a plan going forward.

Vice-Chairperson Sepi Richardson thanked the County for not signing the contract and locking the Roundtable into a three-year agreement. She said, otherwise, the Roundtable would be locked into a huge contract.

V.D Status of Roundtable Work Program Items

Steve Alverson stated that there was a discussion about streamlining work program items, including preparing a brief memo on the work program items. He noted that there were not any new items at the time of packet printing. Steve provided an Aviation Noise News update related to NEXTGEN, and Patty Daniel's reassignment with FAA, Dennis Green taking over Patty's role on the Roundtable, and an article regarding the airlines focus on saving fuel. He also added that Bert, Steve, and John were at the UC Davis Noise Symposium, which was focused on NEXTGEN, and the message for the Roundtable is that the NEXTGEN process is underway and the Roundtable should closely track its implementation at SFO.

Bert Ganoung stated that two portable noise monitors were deployed in South County. Bert agreed that the noise symposium was good.

Questions/Comments: None.

V.E Study Session on Roundtable Efficiency and FY 2012/2013 Work Program

Chairperson Gee introduced this item stating that it was hard to get Roundtable work done with only four meetings a year. He stated that he wants to get everyone involved.

Chairperson Gee passed out cards for people to write on and answer two questions: 1. What would you like to see the Roundtable accomplish over the next 10 months? 2. What would a good year for the Roundtable look like? The answers will be shared with the work program committee to help shape the Roundtable agendas. Chairperson Gee indicated that he would like to get everyone involved because no one has enough time, money and resources. He asked how can we best achieve success and what would this success look like? Chairperson Gee then gave the members of the public and Roundtable members three minutes to write down their responses.

Chairperson Gee asked if anyone would like to share their answers.

Vice-Chairperson Sepi Richardson stated that she wanted to solve the Brisbane and Woodside VOR noise issues to the satisfaction of everyone, and the community requirements for people calling in about noise, and no action is being taken to reduce noise. She stated the Roundtable needs to be more active to resolve these conflicts. She said the Roundtable MOU says to reduce noise. She stated we need to constantly improve.

Brian Perkins stated that he has been watching the Roundtable over the last 20 years, and he felt the Roundtable should be capable of providing relief from single event disturbances, while still working within the federal law. He acknowledged that the Roundtable cannot change the law, but that is what people expect.

Member Ken Ibarra stated that he liked the idea about outreach. He said that a good year is improving community awareness, and establishing a true partnership with the airlines. It always seems that it is an adversarial situation, and while we have a good partnership with SFO, the airlines are not in there yet. There are some communities that are really getting pounded and have real concerns. There are other towns too. Even if you go into San Bruno and have a town hall meeting; we just need to get the awareness out there.

Member Larry May stated that in addition to Woodside and Brisbane, we need to develop a method for identifying issues, immediately communicating to those who can help solve them, coming up with solutions, and implementing those solutions.

Sue Digre stated that members need to be aware and up to speed on aviation and noise issues.

Member Elizabeth Lewis stated a good year would be happier residents in Woodside, Portola Valley, and Brisbane, and we are on our way to that. A good year will also be increased air traffic in our region, which produces a strong economy, but also comes with sensitivity to the noise issues of the community. We need to find some long-term funding sources. She would hate to see the Roundtable fall by the wayside because of cities not being able to afford \$1,500 a year.

Member Julian Chang stated that the Bay Area should use technology to come up with data-driven solutions from the FAA, SFO, and the community. We use "hack-a-thons" to come up with focused results in a concentrated amount of time. He stated we need to reduce noise in Brisbane and Woodside; we must do this in the next ten months.

Member David Burow stated they need to shift focus to single noise events instead of CNEL, because that's what residents care about. And correlate that data to aircraft type. We need to work more closely with airlines. I think the FAA is moving to providing pilots with more latitude under NEXTGEN. The airlines are afraid to come because they do not want the negative publicity. We need to fight noise and not just try to implement rules.

Member Dave Pine stated that we need to establish community/SFO/airline trust in the Roundtable body. We do that by establishing a track record of responsiveness in a fair and professional way. He said the Roundtable is very fragile right now. We don't have a quorum right now. We lost support and our reputation in the community is not high. Ten months from now we need to turn this around.

Member Robert Gottschalk replaced all the windows in his Millbrae home. We need to encourage airlines to look at certain technological improvements.

Jim Lyons stated that he thinks noise data and altitude data should be made more transparent, available, and understandable. Bert's monthly reports are difficult for him to understand. If there is a way the information could be made more accessible, that would be good.

Peter Grace stated that he is worried about NEXTGEN and what position the Roundtable will take with that issue.

Chairperson Gee thanked everyone for sharing their thoughts and said that he wants to collect the cards after the meeting. He stated that there will be three standing committees. Sepi will Chair the Operations and Efficiency committee. Naomi Patridge will chair the Legislative committee, and Jeff Gee will chair the Work Program committee.

Chairperson Gee wants to stop continuing items on the agenda, and assigned the 65 CNEL item to the subcommittee. The cards will be assigned to the committees to solve some of these challenges. He stated that the CATEX for NEXTGEN was adopted in the FAA funding legislation. He asked what should the Roundtable's position be and should the Roundtable write our congressional representatives. He encouraged each member to volunteer for at least one of the committees. He noted that these meetings often occur over conference calls.

Member Dave Pine noted that could we make these committees ad hoc committees, instead of Brown Act committees, just to reduce some of the red tape.

Member Mike McCarron stated that by tradition the Roundtable has followed the Brown Act to protect the integrity of the meetings and make them open to the public. He was surprised that two ad hoc meetings occurred and no airport staff was there. He said the Roundtable Bylaws state the Chairman must chair all of the subcommittees and that the open public meeting law that must be followed.

Member Dave Pine stated that the Brown Act always applies to these meetings and some others, but many members are used to a hybrid of both options. Some of the work could be more efficient if done through ad hoc committees.

Steve Alverson noted that ad hoc committees can be made and formed without a vote. Members can be appointed by the Chair. He stated the Bylaws do require that the Chair and Vice-Chair must act as the Chair and Vice-Chair of the ad hoc committees.

Chairperson Gee stated that the Roundtable got a lot done in the last 30 days because they were done by ad hoc committees. The three standing committees are Bylaw committees and through the committee they can make recommendations to the Roundtable to change the Bylaws.

Vice-Chairperson Sepi Richardson asked if the committees can form task forces.

Chairperson Gee stated that the Operations and Efficiency committee should come forward to the Roundtable with recommended changes to the Bylaws.

Member Dave Pine stated that there is a lot of work to be done in this fiscal year for the Budget committee. He asked if the budget ad hoc committee will remain ad hoc.

Chairperson Gee stated that he wanted to keep the budget committee ad hoc. He asked that the Woodside ad hoc stay alive as well, and that the other standing committees meet soon to discuss the issues before them.

Member Elizabeth Lewis clarified that the three current committees would remain Brown Act committees. Chairperson Gee responded that member Lewis was correct.

Chairperson Gee again asked members to volunteer. The members volunteered as follows:

- Legislative: Gee, Richardson, Chang, Lewis, Digre, and May;
- Work Program: Gee, Richardson, Lewis, Ibarra, Digre, May, and Pine;
- Operations and Efficiency: Gee, Richardson, Lewis, Pine, and May;
- Ad hoc Budget: Pine, Richardson, and Digre;
- Ad hoc Woodside: Burow, Lewis, and Digre.

Chairperson Gee stated that the Roundtable cannot get work done by meeting just six times a year. He said the amount of work completed in the last 30 days is a testament to the ad hoc committee process. He thanked everyone for their ad hoc committee work and for volunteering for the standing committees.

Member Dave Pine encouraged anyone who wants to participate in the budget ad hoc committee to let him know.

VI. Member Communications/Announcements

None.

VII. Adjourn

Chairperson Gee adjourned the meeting at 8:44 pm.