

**Airport / Community Roundtable**  
**Meeting No. 278 Overview**  
**Wednesday, February 1, 2012**

**I. Call to Order / Roll Call / Declaration of Quorum Present**

NOTE: Chairperson Newman was absent; therefore, Vice-Chairperson Richardson was acting Chair for the start of the meeting. Acting Chairperson Richardson called the Regular Meeting of the Airport/Community Roundtable to order, at approximately 7:04 PM, in the David Chetcuti Community Room at Millbrae City Hall. Steve Alverson, Roundtable Chairperson called the roll. A quorum (at least 12 Regular Members) was present as follows:

**REGULAR MEMBERS PRESENT**

**Mike McCarron**, San Francisco International Airport (Alternate)  
**Dave Pine**, County of San Mateo Board of Supervisors  
**Elizabeth Lewis**, Town of Atherton  
**Sepi Richardson**, City of Brisbane/**Vice-Chairperson**  
**Jerry Deal**, City of Burlingame (Alternate for 2/1/12 meeting only)  
**Steve Okamoto**, City of Foster City (Alternate)  
**Naomi Patridge**, City of Half Moon Bay  
**Marie Chuang**, Town of Hillsborough (Alternate)  
**Robert Gottschalk**, City of Millbrae  
**Ann Wengert**, Town of Portola Valley  
**Jeffrey Gee**, City of Redwood City  
**Ken Ibarra**, City of San Bruno  
**Kevin Mullin**, City of South San Francisco  
**David Burow**, Town of Woodside

**REGULAR MEMBERS ABSENT**

City and County of San Francisco Board of Supervisors (Vacant)  
City and County of San Francisco Mayor's Office  
C/CAG Airport Land Use Committee (ALUC)  
City of Belmont  
City of Menlo Park  
City of Pacifica  
City of San Carlos  
City of San Mateo (Vacant)

---

Approved by the Roundtable on June 6, 2012

## **ADVISORY MEMBERS**

### **Airline/Flight Operations**

**Andy Allen**, United Airlines

**Duncan Flett**, United Airlines

### **Federal Aviation Administration**

**Patty Daniel**, Nor Cal TRACON

**Andy Richards**, Regional Air Traffic Control Manager

## **ROUNDTABLE STAFF / CONSULTANTS**

**Steve Alverson**, Roundtable Coordinator

**Phil Wade**, Roundtable Support

## **SAN FRANCISCO INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT STAFF**

**Mike McCarron**, SFO's Director Bureau of Community Affairs

**Bert Ganoung**, Noise Abatement Manager

**David Ong**, Sr. Noise Abatement Systems Manager

Acting Chairperson Richardson requested that the order of Agenda Items II and VI be reversed. Member Gee made a **MOTION** that was **SECONDED** by Member Pine. The motion **PASSED UNANIMOUSLY**.

Acting Chairperson Richardson welcomed the meeting attendees, acknowledging representatives from United Airlines, Continental Airlines, Southwest Airlines, the FAA, as well as other special guests, including Marc Hershman, Brian Perkins from Congresswoman Speier's office, and former Roundtable Chair and Assemblyman Gene Mullin.

## **VI. Recognition of Roundtable Representatives and Alternates for 2012**

Acting Chairperson Richardson opened this agenda item with the recognition of former Roundtable Coordinator, Dave Carbone. She invited former Roundtable Chairperson, Mary Griffin, to speak.

Ms. Griffin stated that thirty-one years ago she was one of the original signatories on the Roundtable Memorandum of Understanding. She indicated that the Roundtable is unique, and that few communities have this kind of representation. Ms. Griffin indicated that Dave Carbone was a great asset to the Roundtable. She stated that he is well informed, intelligent, efficient, and he carried the duties of getting the county together for the Roundtable process. Ms. Griffin thanked Mr. Carbone for his efforts on the Roundtable and the opportunity to speak.

On behalf of the San Francisco Airport Commission, Alternate McCarron presented Dave Carbone with a resolution recognizing his 28 years of service to the County; including overseeing the Roundtable, working with the community on noise issues, and representing the County and the Roundtable on numerous key commissions, committees, and panels.

---

Approved by the Roundtable on June 6, 2012

Alternate McCarron also noted that Mr. Carbone is a recognized leader in the area of airport land use compatibility planning by the FAA and Caltrans' Division of Aeronautics.

Roundtable Coordinator, Steve Alverson, on behalf of the Roundtable, presented Mr. Carbone with a resolution recognizing his many years of successful service as the Roundtable Coordinator. Mr. Alverson thanked Mr. Carbone for establishing a great foundation for Mr. Alverson to work from.

Dave Carbone thanked the Roundtable for the recognition of his service. He personally thanked Mary Griffin, Lou Turpen, Roger Chinn, Roger Lambert, John Martin, Mike McCarron, Bert Ganoung, Patty Daniel, Andy Richards, Richard Newman, Steve Alverson, Connie and Steve Shields, Heather Yoshi, Cindy Gibbs, Evelyn Yendi, past Roundtable chairpersons, Gene Mullin, and to all the current and past Roundtable representatives. Mr. Carbone recognized that the subject of aircraft noise is not easy to learn, and he thanked all the Members for their dedication on the Roundtable. Mr. Carbone concluded by saying that the Roundtable is a leader in what they do, and that they're the ones that get things done.

Acting Chairperson Richardson thanked Mr. Carbone for his service to the Roundtable, and acknowledged Mayor Kirsten Keith as the new Alternate for the City of Menlo Park.

Acting Chairperson Richardson then acknowledged former Member John Lee for his service on the Roundtable. On behalf of the Roundtable, Steve Alverson presented former Member Lee with a resolution acknowledging his twelve years of service to the Roundtable, and his involvement on various Roundtable subcommittees.

Mr. Lee thanked the airport and the County offices. He stated that it was an honor to serve the Roundtable. Mr. Lee concluded by congratulating each member and encouraged them to continue the work they do on the Roundtable.

Acting Chairperson Richardson also acknowledged the service of former Members Toben, Bologoff, and Cohen, as well as former Roundtable administrative assistant, Connie Shields.

Member Ibarra **MOVED** to approve the adoption of Roundtable Resolutions 12-01 through 12-06. Member Patridge **SECONDED** the motion and it **PASSED UNANIMOUSLY**.

### **III. Public Comment on Relevant Items Not on the Agenda**

Jeff Zajas, a community member from the City of Brisbane, addressed Roundtable members, stating that he had originally brought Brisbane's noise issue to the attention of the Roundtable last December. Mr. Zajas indicated that it took ten to twelve months to discuss this issue, fourteen months to get a letter sent to the FAA, and that he felt the Roundtable had not been very responsive. Mr. Zajas concluded by saying he hoped, moving forward, it would not be an adversarial environment, and that they could continue to work together to get this done.

#### IV. Consent Agenda Items

Acting Chairperson Richardson opened the discussion of the Consent Agenda Items by stating that she wanted certain revisions made to the meeting overview of the Workshop that was held in Brisbane on October 5<sup>th</sup>. Chairperson Richardson read the requested changes to the Roundtable members, which included the addition of specific data related to airport operations and overflights in the City of Brisbane as provided by Bert Ganoung and Barry Corlett; revisions to comments provided by Assemblyman Jerry Hill; additional comments provided by community members from Brisbane; and clarification on Chairperson Newman's concluding comments at the end of the Workshop.

Acting Chairperson Richardson asked for a motion to approve these additions to the October 5<sup>th</sup> meeting overview. Member Gee **MOVED** to approve these additions. The motion was **SECONDED** by Member Ibarra. The motion **PASSED** with five members abstaining due to their absence at the October 5<sup>th</sup> Workshop.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** Member Ibarra asked if there is a recording of the October 5<sup>th</sup> Workshop in Brisbane, which Acting Chairperson Richardson indicated there was.

#### V. Airport Director's Comments

Alternate McCarron provided the Airport Director's Comments on behalf of John Martin, who was absent. Alternate McCarron indicated that SFO's website has new 3D flight tracking software that is available for public use. He stated that the software provides a good representation of what it is like to fly in the Bay Area, the amount traffic they have, the complexity of routes, the intersection of routes, and the separation requirements that are in place. Alternate McCarron also noted that SOIA/PRM has been used on several days in November, as well as in December and January, for about 50 hours of reduced delays. He also stated that the ceiling was lowered to 1,600 feet; however, Patty Daniel of TRACON clarified that it had not yet been lowered. Alternate McCarron stated that once the ceiling was lowered, this would provide some noise relief to the San Mateo/Foster City area on approach. Alternate McCarron continued by saying that the Noise Abatement staff has been proactive in monitoring the Fly Quiet Program and the Shoreline Departure. On behalf of John Martin, Alternate McCarron welcomed all the new members of the Roundtable, and encouraged them to get some training on noise and aviation issues, as well as to visit the airport. He concluded by saying that Member Martin looks forward to working with them.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** Jeff Zajas stated that he had used the 3D modeling software on SFO's website, and that it is wonderful. Mr. Zajas continued by saying that in their January 5<sup>th</sup> meeting with Jackie Speier, everyone agreed that there would be an opportunity to review the data and modeling prior to its delivery to FAA, which did not happen. Mr. Zajas stated that he hoped, moving forward, when commitments are made they're followed through and done, because it helps them feel that their opinions and input

---

Approved by the Roundtable on June 6, 2012

are valued. Mr. Zajas concluded by thanking Bert Ganoung for being a proponent of providing the community the data they requested.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** None.

## **II. Election of Roundtable Officers for Calendar Year 2012**

Acting Chairperson Richardson opened this agenda item by stating that Mark Church, from San Mateo County, was Chair for seven or eight years, and that last year, the Roundtable had a member of the public as the Chair, Richard Newman. Acting Chairperson Richardson stated that Member Gee and Member Pine had expressed their interest in becoming Chair of the Roundtable. Chairperson Richardson stated that Richard Newman had not indicated to her that he was seeking reelection; she further added that she would like to continue serving as the Vice-Chair of the Roundtable for another year.

Member Pine **NOMINATED** Member Gee for the position of Chair of the Roundtable. Member Lewis **SECONDED** the nomination, and the nomination for Member Gee to serve as the Chairperson of the Roundtable for calendar year 2012 **PASSED UNANIMOUSLY**.

Chairperson Gee stated that he was honored and humbled to be chosen as the Chair of the Roundtable. Chairperson Gee stated that they are very lucky to live in San Mateo County, which has been the second least impacted County in the State during this recession. He indicated that SFO is a big part of their success, and has helped them not be as financially impacted as other parts of California. Chairperson Gee continued by saying that, at the same time, they need to ensure that their residents have a good quality of life. Therefore, the Roundtable needs to work with their communities, SFO, the airlines, pilots, and FAA to ensure that San Mateo County is still a great county to live in. Chairperson Gee concluded by thanking all the members again for his election.

Chairperson Gee noted that the next item is the election of a Vice-Chair. Member Lewis **NOMINATED** Sepi Richardson for Vice-Chair. Member Patridge **SECONDED** the nomination, and the nomination for Member Richardson to serve as the Vice-Chairperson of the Roundtable for calendar year 2012 **PASSED UNANIMOUSLY**.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** None.

## **VII.A Update of Crossing Altitude of Oceanic Arrivals over the Woodside VOR: History and Current Altitude Findings**

SFO Aircraft Noise Abatement Manager Bert Ganoung opened this agenda item by welcoming Chairperson Gee to his new position on the Roundtable. Mr. Ganoung provided an overview of the major arrival patterns into SFO from various destinations. He indicated that the Noise Office is reviewing old Roundtable packets to research the history of this issue. Mr. Ganoung stated that the Roundtable had begun analysis of aircraft altitudes over the Woodside VOR well before 1998; looking at flight tracks and checking the ability

of flights to go over the area. Mr. Ganoung stated that they have not been able to find a copy of the so called "Eshoo agreement", but that they are looking for it and have contacted Congresswoman Eshoo's office and the FAA to see if they have a copy of the agreement.

Mr. Ganoung noted a couple of Roundtable work program items that had explored moving flights from 6,000 to 7,000 feet and running a trial of having Hawaii arrival flights, between 4 and 7 AM, bump up to 8,000 feet. He noted that this issue was on the November 1998 Roundtable agenda, because there were 100 complaint calls a month generated by these flights. Mr. Ganoung then noted that the Woodside VOR issue seemed to drop off the Roundtable agenda. He did note that FAA incorporated the 8,000-foot crossing altitude into their procedures, under noise abatement. Mr. Ganoung stated that the history of this issue began with the Atherton area being affected by arrivals from Hawaii between 4 and 7 AM. He indicated that after many meetings it was determined that aircraft could possibly cross at 8,000 feet. Mr. Ganoung also noted that Oceanic Tailored Arrivals (OTAs) were added to this approach, and that it has been in a test phase for some time, but not officially charted.

Mr. Ganoung showed slides of arrival flight tracks. He noted that turboprop aircraft are brought in off the coast because they are slower than jet aircraft; he also noted that Big Sur traffic, which turns over the Woodside VOR, is vectored on days when weather is bad or traffic volume is high. Mr. Ganoung noted that altitudes in the FAA's radar data are accurate within plus or minus 300 feet. Therefore, an aircraft at or above 7,700 feet mean sea level, is considered to be at the 8,000-foot crossing altitude. He concluded by stating that there were more than 25 arrivals below 7,700 feet in the months of June, July, and August, which appears to be happening on an annual basis. These aircraft were predominately OTAs.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** Member Burow asked Mr. Ganoung when there would be a more comprehensive report. Mr. Ganoung responded by saying that he agreed to provide an update of the Woodside VOR issue and provided the data he has to this point. He indicated that the Aircraft Noise Abatement Office Staff have been doing a lot of research and that this issue was put off as a non-agenda item unless there were more than 25 flights below 7,700 feet.

Chairperson Gee asked the Roundtable Members to forward any correspondence they have related to this issue to Mr. Ganoung. Member Burow asked if Mr. Ganoung had contacted Congresswoman Eshoo's office, which Mr. Ganoung said he had.

Member Pine drew the Roundtable attention to FAA Order NCT7110.65T, which requires that all Oceanic jet arrivals inbound from the west shall cross the OSI at or above 8,000 feet. Mr. Ganoung noted that procedure is only in effect when "traffic is permitting."

Andy Richards, Regional Air Traffic Manager from the FAA, addressed the Roundtable. He provided some background history on the Woodside issue, stating that this issue began

with complaints regarding four or five DC-10 aircraft that arrived from Hawaii between 4 and 7 AM. Working with the Roundtable, Mr. Richards continued, the FAA agreed to test two Woodside crossing altitudes: one at 7,000 feet and the other at 8,000 feet. He noted that he's never met Congresswoman Eshoo, or signed any agreements with her.

Chairperson Gee asked Mr. Richards how the "voluntary" agreement is documented. Mr. Richards stated that there was an informal test of this procedure, and that it was finally added to FAA's standard operating procedures, under the "noise abatement" section. Member Burow asked if this procedure was only for OTAs, which Mr. Richards answered that it was.

Member Wengert asked how long the OTA test has been in place. Patty Daniel responded by saying that tailored arrival procedure has been in place for three or four years. Ms. Daniel stated that only certain aircraft can fly this procedure, and that it has to be by pilot request. Ms. Daniel stated that when aircraft are allowed, traffic permitting, to approach in a glide profile, then there is less fuel burned and less noise. In the future, she stated, this is how the FAA wants to manage aircraft on all arrivals. More aircraft will be flying the OTA as a part of the ASPIRE Partnership (Asia and Pacific Initiative to Reduce Emissions) that is focused on reducing fuel burn and carbon emissions. Ms. Daniel concluded by saying the OTA is different than anything the FAA publishes now, which is why it's still in a test phase.

Vice-Chairperson Richardson asked Mr. Richards how they got their request to study the Woodside issue. Mr. Richards stated they received the request in writing from the Roundtable. Vice-Chairperson Richardson asked whether there were any studies conducted to look at potential impacts from this procedure change. Mr. Richards stated that a consultant did prepare models, and that shifting noise was an issue they were concerned with. He indicated that after working with the United Airlines flight crews, they did not see a shift in flight tracks. Vice-Chairperson Richardson asked if a published procedure is not followed, who is responsible for making sure they're followed. Mr. Richards responded by saying that airlines will file routes of flight, and air traffic control will ensure that their route of flight is safe in relation to other airplanes. He stated that aircraft incapable of flying certain routes will be accommodated on an as-needed basis. He concluded that in a congested air space such as the Bay Area's, there is little room for variance in procedures.

**Jim Lyons Presentation:** Mr. Lyons opened his presentation by stating that aircraft on arrival to SFO and OAK overfly the Woodside VOR/Portola Valley area, and that low-flying aircraft is disrupting sleep and the enjoyment of their property. He stated that his home is at an elevation of about 2,300 feet, and that he lives in a noise-sensitive area.

Mr. Lyons stated they noticed an increase in jet aircraft overflights beginning in 2006, and that SFO data supports this. In 2010, Mr. Lyons continued, 21,535 aircraft overflew the Woodside VOR, which is a 13.5 percent increase from 2008. In total, there were 61,000 jet overflights between 2008 and 2010.

Mr. Lyons noted that there has been a drop in the average altitude over the Woodside VOR, from 7,500 feet in May of 2005 to 6,600 feet in February of 2010. Mr. Lyons stated that an altitude of 6,600 feet is only 4,300 feet above his home. He continued by stating that a decrease in altitude from 8,000 to 6,600 feet increases noise levels by approximately 4.2 dB, which is perceived as a 34 percent increase in noise volume.

Mr. Lyons stated that during nighttime hours, aircraft routinely overfly the Woodside VOR at less than 8,000 feet, and that two-thirds of all night-time flights from 2008 through 2011 were below 8,000 feet. Mr. Lyons continued by stating that UAL Flight 76 has been the worst offender, with nearly 75 percent of all its flights, between 2009 and 2011, being below 8,000 feet, and 30 percent being below 6,000 feet.

Mr. Lyons played two audio files of aircraft overflying his home; one overflight at an altitude of approximately 5,708 feet on January 23, 2012 at 10:49 PM, which reached 81.1 dB, and the other at an altitude of 5,921 feet on January 24, 2012 that reached 82.8 dB. Mr. Lyons defied anyone to sleep through 82.8 dB. He added it could not be done. Mr. Lyons then showed a slide indicating that significant aircraft noise events in San Mateo County increased over 2010.

Mr. Lyons stated that the Eshoo agreement was created in 2000 to address aircraft noise levels over the Peninsula, and that the agreement is noted in the 2005 letter from Congresswoman Eshoo's office to Mr. Withycombe of the FAA. Mr. Lyons noted FAA Order NCT7110.65T, which establishes the procedures for Oceanic arrivals over the OSI. Mr. Lyons indicated that, per SFO's own records, between the hours of 10:30 PM and 6:30 AM, these rules are violated two-thirds of the time.

Mr. Lyons asked the Roundtable to take action to reduce commercial aircraft noise. He asked that the Roundtable request data from SFO regarding aircraft altitudes and noise levels. He asked that the Roundtable analyze this data and report the results to the public, and that the Roundtable ask Nor Cal TRACON and the FAA why the Eshoo agreement is being ignored.

Mr. Lyons continued by asking the Roundtable to ask SFO to provide reports of Woodside VOR overflight; to install noise monitoring equipment at the Woodside VOR and in Portola Valley for at least four months; to provide single-event exceedance reports for the Woodside VOR and Portola Valley; and request that Nor Cal TRACON and FAA state whether they intend to comply with the Eshoo agreement.

Chairperson Gee thanked Mr. Lyons for his presentation and then opened the floor to public comment.

**Public Comments:** Jeff Zajjas thanked Mr. Lyons for his presentation. He then asked FAA and the airlines to stay after the meeting so they could talk about how the procedures work. Mr. Zajjas stated that he made a recording of overflights in Brisbane, and that he would like to have an explanation of why aircraft are turning early. Chairperson Gee

indicated that it would be best that conversations with Mr. Zajac and FAA be conducted in public before the Roundtable rather than after the meeting.

Caroline Vertongen, a resident of Portola Valley, addressed the Roundtable by stating that she has observed an increase in overflights, and that she agreed that the average overflight altitude is below 8,000 feet. Ms. Vertongen stated that she lives on a hill and it's frightening to see the belly of an overflying aircraft. She stated that studies have been made on the affects of aircraft noise, which have shown that aircraft noise can impair cognitive functions, cause hearing impairment, and cause sleep disorders. The FAA, she stated, ignores this data. Ms. Vertongen stated that low-flying aircraft are also a safety hazard, which also affects their quality of life. Ms. Vertongen stated that private citizens are required to follow regulations, and asked why the FAA is allowed to violate these agreements and pretend they don't. She concluded by stating that the PG&E accident should serve as a reminder that it is time for FAA to adhere to noise reduction and safety rules.

Victor Schachter, a resident of Portola Valley, addressed the Roundtable by asking what environmental impact studies have been conducted during this test period, as required by law, to determine the impacts on our communities. Mr. Schachter stated that the aircraft noise pollution is nearly destroying their quality of life. He continued by saying that they have a right to quiet just as much as they have the right to use the air safely, but that they don't have the right to do this without environmental study. Mr. Schachter stated that he was shocked to hear the denial of the Eshoo agreement. He stated that there is no dispute of the 2005 letter, and that if they continue to see this neglect by the FAA they will pursue political and legal means. The number of violations, he continued, is inexcusable. Mr. Schachter stated that between December 28 and January 24, he was woken numerous times by aircraft overflights between 5:30 and 8:30 AM and 9:00 and 11:30 PM. Mr. Schachter concluded by urging the Roundtable to continue to work towards a resolution.

Mary Jane Lyons, a Woodside resident, stated that they've lived on Skyline for twenty years, and have sent a lot of letters to SFO and the FAA over the last two years. She stated that the problem is getting unbearable. Mrs. Lyons stated that three weeks ago, between 4 and 5 PM, there were twenty-two aircraft overflights. She concluded by saying they live twenty-two miles away in the country, but that they have brought the airport and the runway to them.

Frank Rothschild, a Woodside resident, stated that he has lived next to the Woodside VOR for 15 years, and that planes go over his chimney in a constant line, typically under 8,000 feet, which he's confirmed by checking SFO data. Mr. Rothschild stated that he's also looked at the NextGEN air control system website, which is being tested at SFO. Mr. Rothschild stated that he does not know of anyone who was notified of this test, which has failed. He continued by saying that no one was informed of NextGen test, and that they don't want NextGEN. He stated that when aircraft fly over, the wildlife community is disturbed. Mr. Rothschild also explained that they live in a scenic corridor, but they have

jets flying over their heads. Mr. Rothschild explained that NextGEN is before Congress and has been incorporated into an appropriations bill, but that no one has asked him about a test or a permanent change to aviation that could affect his home. He continued that the NextGEN demo on the FAA website shows aircraft overflying the Woodside VOR at 6,100 feet. Mr. Rothschild stated that he assumed the FAA is aware of this, as it appears that this is the model that will be implemented nationwide. Mr. Rothschild stated that this is unacceptable for human beings, and that while he cannot determine what's acceptable from the aviation side, it's not acceptable on the ground. He concluded by stating he's grateful for the Roundtable, because the only other option is a legal one.

Tina Nguelyn, a resident of Portola Valley, stated that the quality of life has been deteriorating in Portola Valley. Beyond sleep, she stated, there's a lot of noise during the daytime. Ms. Nguelyn stated that aircraft are vectored in from southern locations. Using the San Jose website, she noted that on October 4<sup>th</sup>, 2010, there were 80 flights over the Woodside VOR; over thirty percent of which were at an altitude between 5,000 and 6,000 feet, while the majority was between 6,000 and 7,000 feet. Only twelve percent was above 8,000 feet. Ms. Nguelyn stated that one overflight noise event can last up to two and a half minutes; which, if there are ten flights overflights in an hour, constitutes a half-hour of aircraft noise.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** Chairperson Gee thanked everyone for their time and asked Mr. Lyons to email his presentation to Steve Alverson.

An audience member asked if a transcript would be available for this meeting. Chairperson Gee responded by saying that a meeting overview would be approved at the next meeting.

Member Mullin asked if a noise monitor in Woodside was a cost concern. Mr. Ganoung responded that noise monitors have been placed at the Woodside VOR many times in support of the testing, and that they have over a year's worth of data for that site for different times of the year. If they want a permanent location, he concluded, it's approximately \$30,000.

Chairperson Gee asked if Mr. Ganoung could bring back the 2009 data, which Mr. Ganoung said they could. Chairperson Gee asked that the representatives from Woodside and Portola Valley form an ad hoc committee and come back with a recommendation at the next meeting about installing a temporary or permanent noise monitoring facility, and establishing a single noise event exceedance level. Chairperson Gee also stated that the Roundtable would draft a letter to FAA asking for them to comply with the Eshoo agreement.

Member Pine asked for clarification on the meeting overview process. Steve Alverson responded by saying that staff prepares meeting overviews, which can be found in the Roundtable packets, that try to capture the essence of a Roundtable meeting without going through a court reporter process.

## **VII.B Review of Fly Quiet Program Quarterly Report**

Bert Ganoung provided the Fly Quiet Program Quarterly Report, stating that the trend line for fleet noise quality averages has improved. He stated that the noise exceedance rating averages have been on a downward trend. Mr. Ganoung continued by saying that nighttime preferential runway use averages have also been sliding, which he said was the result of a lot of seasonal traffic; noting a higher score than usual in the fourth quarter. Mr. Ganoung stated that the Shoreline departure rating averages had a dip in the fourth quarter. He also noted that they will be using Runway 1 more often than the gap and shoreline departures, which will help on the windy days. He continued by noting that gap departure climb rating averages have been on decline. Mr. Ganoung stated that the Foster City arrival rating averages have had a slight improvement, and concluded by saying that they're still working hard to keep Shoreline departures out of Brisbane.

## **VII.C Update on FAA's PORTE THREE Departure Analysis**

Steve Alverson addressed this agenda item by reminding members that the Roundtable had authorized former Chairperson Newman to request the FAA to study the use of the PORTE THREE departure procedure. Mr. Alverson continued by saying that the FAA responded that there was not enough specificity to the request; therefore, former Chairperson Newman revised the letter and ran it past the City of Brisbane. Mr. Alverson indicated that there was a meeting held with Congresswoman Jackie Speier, during which a commitment was made to get the letter out by February 1, 2012, and that former Chairperson Newman sent the packet to FAA today. Copies of the packet arrived here before the meeting.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** Chairperson Gee noted that, as Jeff Zajas mentioned, there was an understanding that there would be community input on the letter. He indicated that residents did not have an opportunity to review the letter, and asked that if there was anything missing in the letter to let the Roundtable know.

Barry Corlett, a resident of Brisbane, stated that there was no review of the letter as agreed upon. He continued by saying that the letter identifies four alternatives, with alternatives one and two looking hardly different from what is currently done today. Mr. Corlett also noted that following the PORTE THREE departure, as published, was one of the alternatives they had asked for. Bert Ganoung and Chairperson Gee noted that the "Chartered Path" alternative in the letter examines the PORTE THREE departure as published.

## **VII.D Budget Update for FY 2010/2011**

Chairperson Gee asked Member Pine to provide an update on the Roundtable budget. Member Pine indicated that there was not enough budget adopted for this fiscal year. Member Pine stated that the prior year had a budget of approximately \$150,000; \$60,000 of which went to ESA, with the remainder going to the website consultant and County staff.

---

Approved by the Roundtable on June 6, 2012

Member Pine indicated that in the absence of County Roundtable staff, ESA has stepped up to fill the gap. He concluded by recommending that an ad hoc committee be formed to examine what needs to be done to support the Roundtable and addressing the budget issue moving forward.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** Chairperson Gee requested volunteers to work with Member Pine on the budget ad hoc committee. Chairperson Gee, Vice-Chairperson Richardson, Naomi Patridge, and Sue Digre (in absentia) volunteered for the ad hoc committee.

#### **VII.E Review/Approval of Resolution 12-07: Designating Roundtable Meeting Dates, Time, and Place for Calendar Year 2012**

Chairperson Gee suggested that the resolution add two more meetings, one in March and one in June, stating that additional meetings are required to address the community's noise concerns. Chairperson Gee noted that the details regarding the additional costs associated with the two additional meetings could be examined later. Member Lewis made a **MOTION** to add two additional meetings to the Roundtable schedule in March and June. The motion was **SECONDED** by Vice Chairperson Richardson. The motion to extend the Roundtable's schedule by two meetings **PASSED UNANIMOUSLY**.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** None.

#### **VII.F Appoint a Roundtable Work Program Subcommittee to Prepare Draft Work Program for FY 2012/2013**

Chairperson Gee continued this item to the next meeting.

#### **VIII. Aviation Noise News Update**

Steve Alverson stated that Congress is on the verge of approving a four-year reauthorization bill that will fund the FAA. He also noted that the Air Transport Association has changed their name to Airlines for America. Mr. Alverson drew the Roundtable's attention to a New York Times article regarding airport delays. The article, Mr. Alverson noted, stated that seven airports including SFO account for 80 percent of delays in the U.S. Lastly, Mr. Alverson reminded Roundtable members that the UC Davis Aviation Noise/Air Quality Symposium will be occurring in Palm Springs from March 4<sup>th</sup> through the 6<sup>th</sup>, and encouraged anyone who could to attend.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** Jim Lyons commented that the pending FAA funding reauthorization legislation includes a provision that would exempt NextGEN from U.S. environmental law. Mr. Alverson confirmed Mr. Lyons statement regarding the exemption for NextGEN, and noted that the Roundtable had submitted a letter to Congress opposing this provision in the FAA funding reauthorization legislation. Chairperson Gee asked Mr. Alverson to track this issue in case it needed to be followed up on.

## **IX. Member Communications / Announcements**

Chairperson Gee thanked Richard Newman for his service as the former Roundtable Chair. Chairperson Gee stated that Member Newman understands aircraft noise issues, and that he looked forward to working with Member Newman in the future. Member Pine also expressed his appreciation for working with Member Newman; stating that he worked very hard for the community. Member Pine continued by saying that he found it unfortunate some of the ways Member Newman was treated by the public, and that he commended him for his service. Chairperson Gee also thanked Member Pine for all his efforts on the budget and other issues. Chairperson Gee thanked the public, FAA, and the airlines. He stated that they all have to work together. There's going to be a lot of work outside this formal setting, he concluded, but that it would all be brought back here for formal action.

**Comments/Concerns/Questions:** None.

## **X. Adjourn**

Chairperson Gee adjourned the meeting at 9:23 PM.