

**Airport / Community Roundtable  
Meeting No. 271 Overview  
Wednesday, December 1, 2010**

**I. Call to Order / Roll Call / Declaration of Quorum Present**

Chairperson Mark Church called the Regular Meeting of the Airport/Community Roundtable to order, at approximately 7:09 PM, in the David Chetcuti Community Room at Millbrae City Hall. Steven R. Alverson, Roundtable Coordinator called the roll. A quorum (at least 12 Regular Members) was present as follows:

**REGULAR MEMBERS PRESENT**

**Julian C. L. Chang**, City and County of San Francisco Mayor's Office  
**John Martin**, City and County of San Francisco Airport Commission  
**Mark Church**, County of San Mateo Board of Supervisors  
**Richard Newman**, C/CAG Airport Land Use Committee (ALUC)/**Roundtable Vice-Chairperson**  
**Elizabeth Lewis**, Town of Atherton  
**Coralin Feierbach**, City of Belmont  
**Sepi Richardson**, City of Brisbane  
**Michael Brownrigg**, City of Burlingame  
**Naomi Patridge**, City of Half Moon Bay  
**Christine Krolik**, Town of Hillsborough  
**Nadia V. Holober**, City of Millbrae  
**Sue Digre**, City of Pacifica  
**Jeffrey Gee**, City of Redwood City  
**Omar Ahmad**, City of San Carlos  
**John Lee**, City of San Mateo  
**Kevin Mullin**, City of South San Francisco  
**David Burow**, Town of Woodside

**REGULAR MEMBERS ABSENT**

City and County of San Francisco Board of Supervisors  
City of Foster City  
City of Menlo Park  
Town of Portola Valley  
City of San Bruno

**ADVISORY MEMBERS PRESENT**

**Airline/Flight Operations**

**Captain Flett**, United Airlines

**Federal Aviation Administration**

None

**ROUNDTABLE STAFF / CONSULTANTS**

**Dave Carbone**, Roundtable Program Manager  
**Steve Alverson**, Roundtable Coordinator  
**Connie Shields**, Roundtable Administrative Assistant  
**Vanessa Lindlaw**, Roundtable Media Program/Consultant

**SAN FRANCISCO INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT STAFF**

**Mike McCarron**, Director Bureau of Community Affairs  
**Bert Ganoung**, Noise Abatement Manager  
**David Ong**, Sr. Noise Abatement Systems Manager  
**Ara Balian**, Noise Abatement Specialist

## II. Public Comments of Items Not on the Agenda

Former Roundtable Chairperson, Mary Griffin, wished outgoing Chairperson Mark Church well and thanked him for keeping the Roundtable headed in the right direction. Ms. Griffin added that the Roundtable is a wonderful process to watch and wished Chairperson Church well in his new job. She also thanked all of the Roundtable members for their time and energy.

Chairperson Church thanked Ms. Griffin and acknowledged her many years of public service to the community.

Jeff Zajas lives in Brisbane and has experienced a large increase in the aircraft noise in the past five months. He said he realizes aircraft operations at SFO are increasing, but there has been a marked increase over the ten year period he lived there.

Chairperson Church thanked Mr. Zajas for his comments and said that SFO Noise Abatement Staff would be addressing changes in SFO aircraft operations later on the agenda.

## III. Consent Agenda Items

- A. Review of Airport Director's Report for September 2010
- B. Review of Airport Director's Report for October 2010
- C. Review of a Roundtable Regular Meeting Overview for October 2010
- D. Review/Approval of Correspondence/Information Items for December 2010

Comments/Concerns/Questions: Sepi Richardson requested that items A and B be removed from the consent agenda.

**Action:** Vice Chairperson Richard Newman **MOVED** the approval of the Consent Agenda Items C and D. The motion was **SECONDED** by Nadia Holober and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY.**

Comments/Concerns/Questions: Sepi Richardson thanked SFO Aircraft Noise Abatement Office staff for working with the residents of Brisbane who have experienced a tremendous increase in aircraft flights. There are flights every two minutes, which wake up residents all hours of the night. This is a really difficult issue Brisbane is facing. Noise measurement data has been collected and will be analyzed.

**Action:** Sepi Richardson **MOVED** the approval of the Consent Agenda Items A and B. The motion was **SECONDED** by Kevin Mullin and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY.**

## IV. Airport Director's Comments

- Airport Director, John Martin, indicated that he is aware of the Brisbane concerns and has staff working on ways to minimize noise, but it is important to acknowledge that noise won't go away completely
- Personally thanked Chairperson Church for his 14 years of Roundtable leadership and support of SFO

Comments/Concerns/Questions: Chairperson Church thanked Director Martin for his steadfast support of the Roundtable.

**V. Consideration / Approval / Presentation of the Jon C. Long Fly Quiet Awards for 2009 – 2010**

A. Chairperson Church provided an overview of the Award Recipients' achievements

B. Chairperson Church called for a motion to approve the Awards as follows:

I. Most Improved Airline – Lufthansa German Airlines

**Action:** Julian Chang **MOVED** the approval of the award as designated. The motion was **SECONDED** by John Lee and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY**.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: Steve Woodward, Regional Director of Operations and Airport Services for Lufthansa thanked the Roundtable for the Award and said Lufthansa was honored to receive it. He said Lufthansa is working hard to improve all aspects of its operation environmentally.

II. Quietest Overall Airline – Mesaba Airlines

**Action:** Sue Digre **MOVED** the approval of the award as designated. The motion was **SECONDED** by Nadia Holober and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY**.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: Irene Alpen from Delta Airlines accepted the award on behalf of Mesaba Airlines and said they were truly honored to receive it.

III. Chairperson's Award – American Airlines

**Action:** Rich Newman **MOVED** the approval of the award as designated. The motion was **SECONDED** by Elizabeth Lewis and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY**.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: George Tucker, American Airline's Director/Chief Pilot San Francisco thanked the Roundtable for the award and indicated that American Airlines spends a great deal of its time training their pilots to fly quietly at SFO. He also announced that as of April 5, 2011, American Airlines will no longer operate MD-80s at SFO.

C. Chairperson Church and Roundtable Program Manager David F. Carbone presented the Fly Quiet Awards to each of the Airlines

Comments/Concerns/Questions: None.

**VI. Guest Presentation: Benefit of Precision Runway Monitor/Simultaneous Instrument Offset Approach (PRM/SOIA) to Runway 28 Right**

United Airlines Captain Duncan Flett gave a presentation on the installation and use of the Precision Runway Monitor/Simultaneous Instrument Offset Approach (PRM/SOIA) to Runway 28 Right at SFO. He explained that the PRM was installed in the 2001/2002 timeframe and SOIA began in October 2004, which provides for a higher arrival rate during low visibility conditions. Because the runways are closely spaced together, the arrival rate is only 28 per hour without SOIA. With SOIA the rate increases to 32 to 46 per hour. The noise benefit of SOIA is that it reduces delays, which helps minimize arrivals getting backed up later into the night when visibilities are low.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: David Burow asked if SOIA is NextGen technology. Captain Flett responded that SOIA is old technology, but that SFO Noise Abatement Manager, Bert Ganoung, would be giving an SFO NextGen update later on the agenda. David Burow asked

where United Airlines was in the process of installing NextGen technology on its aircraft. Captain Flett responded that United Airlines was not where it needed to be on NextGen technology on its aircraft, but was working on it. He expected to see the fleet mix improve over the next couple of years. Bert indicated that NextGen will likely get SFO to a 45 to 60 aircraft per hour arrival rate. Sepi Richardson asked what UAL is doing to reduce noise at SFO. Captain Flett responded that the primary noise benefit in the use of SOIA. Christine Krolik asked what does PRM stand for and how often is it used? Captain Flett said PRM stands for Precision Runway Monitor and indicated that it is more accurate along the approach corridor than standard radar. Bert Ganoung indicated that SOIA PRM was used eight days in the past two months. John Martin indicated that there was \$20 million invested in the PRM system. Christine Krolik asked if the SOIA PRM technology represented a big step in reducing arrival delays? Captain Flett responded that it was. Vice Chairperson Newman reminded the Roundtable that the original solution to the arrival delays was to rebuild the runways further apart. However, that process stopped and while technology can help reduce delays, it does not negate the fact that the runways are still only 700 feet apart. Sue Digre said that she assumed that the aircraft are staggered on approach to avoid wake turbulence. Captain Flett said that was correct. Sepi Richardson said she is mindful of the great job the airlines are doing and that there are many things in the cockpit that need to be checked. She asked what is being done to reduce delays that result from completing paperwork. Captain Flett United is working on it, but some of the forms must still be completed manually. Jeff Zajas asked when the last time the routes at SFO were changes. Bert Ganoung responded that the routes have been the about the same for 30 years. Mr. Zajas asked what the procedure is to change the routes. Bert Ganoung responded that it is a difficult and lengthy process and FAA's attention is focused on implementing NextGen not changing routes. Christine Krolik said that the Roundtable's Charter prevents shifting noise from one community to another.

#### **VII. Update on SFO Passenger and Aircraft Operations Levels**

Bert Ganoung gave a presentation on the change in passenger and operations levels at SFO over the past decade. He reminded everyone of the downturn in traffic due to 9/11, SARS, and most recently the downturn in the economy. While operations and passenger traffic has improved recently, SFO still has not reached the levels that occurred in 1999. Passengers are up due to improved load factors, but operations continue to lag.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: Julian Chang said that some of traffic that had left SFO for Oakland and San Jose International Airports has migrated back. Bert Ganoung said that trend could reverse again if delays at SFO become problematic for the airlines. Julian Chang asked what will the opening of Terminal 2 do for traffic? Bert Ganoung said that it will help with some of the congestion in the terminal area, but is not expected to result in increased traffic.

#### **VIII. FY 2010 – 2011 Roundtable Work Program Items**

##### **A. Update on SFO's Recent Portable Noise Monitoring Efforts**

Bert Ganoung provided a verbal report on SFO's portable noise monitoring program indicating that Aircraft Noise Abatement staff will put small portable noise monitors in folks' backyards when there is not a permanent noise monitor close enough to cover it. There has historically been a backlog of residents interested in portable noise monitoring, which the Noise Abatement Office has worked through. Depending on staff workload and the number of outstanding requests, portable noise monitoring can usually be accomplished in two to four weeks of the request date with the monitoring report being generated about a month after the noise monitoring is complete. SFO has completed three recent portable noise monitoring efforts in Brisbane and measures once a quarter in Belmont.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: None.

**B. Status of the Implementation of Required Navigation Performance (RNP) Procedures at SFO**

Bert Ganoung provided an update on the status of the implementation of Required Navigation Performance (RNP) procedures at SFO. Bert indicated that RNP can be thought of as being synonymous with Global Positioning System or GPS. There are currently two charted RNP procedures for SFO: one for Alaska Airlines and the other for United Airlines. Southwest and American Airlines are both in the process of developing their own RNP procedures for SFO.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: None.

**C. Fly Quiet Program Quarterly Report**

Bert Ganoung reviewed the Fly Quiet Program results for the Third Quarter 2010. Fleet Noise, Gap Departures, and Noise Exceedances are showing improving trends. Nighttime Preferential Runway Use has dropped slightly due to runway maintenance, but is still better than last year. Bert expects to improvement in this area in the first and second quarters of 2011. The Shoreline Departures are showing a bit of a declining trend, but have been improving recently. SFO Noise Abatement Staff met with Emirates Airlines to get improvement on their Shoreline Departures. There are problems with Emirates charts, which once resolved should lead to an improvement in their performance. Foster City Arrival Rating is showing a downward trend, but SFO is working with the airlines to improve performance. The Noise Abatement Office is also working with some of the low performers on the Gap Departures including Continental Airlines.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: Christine Krolik asked if airlines are still penalized if they are assigned Runway 28L? Bert said all of the airlines are treated equally whether they are assigned to Runway 28L or not. Jeffrey Gee asked why some tracks appeared to completely miss the Foster City arrival. Bert said that some of the tracks are the result of vectoring due to the mix of aircraft and where they are coming from. Kevin Mullins noted that most of the Shoreline Departures look good, but those aircraft that miss the turn do so by a wide margin and questioned why some aircraft do so poorly. Bert said that there can be a variety of contributing factors including pilot/controller communications, activity in the cockpit, and the recent problem with the published departure procedure for a few airlines. Rich Newman added that wind and weather conditions can affect aircraft performance as well.

**IX. Consideration / Approval of a Recommendation from the Strategic Planning Subcommittee, re: Recommended Roundtable Strategic Plan 2011 - 2014**

Roundtable Coordinator, Steve Alverson, reviewed the Recommended Roundtable Strategic Plan 2011 – 2014, which the Roundtable had a month to review prior to this meeting. The Plan sets vision and focus of the Roundtable for the next three years. If approved, it will become effective July 2011.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: Chairperson Mark Church thanked Roundtable Staff and the Strategic Plan Subcommittee for their hard work in putting the plan together.

**Action:** Rich Newman **MOVED** approval of the Recommended Roundtable Strategic Plan 2011 - 2014. The motion was **SECONDED** by Omar Ahmad and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY.**

**X. Consideration / Approval of a Proposed Revision to the Roundtable Bylaws**

Steve Alverson reviewed a proposed change to the Roundtable Bylaws that is intended to address instances when a previous member entity that has left the Roundtable seeks to return to the Roundtable. There also other minor revisions clarifying the current Roundtable members at the time the Bylaws were approved.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: None.

**Action:** Sepi Richardson **MOVED** approval of the Proposed Revision to the Roundtable Bylaws. The motion was **SECONDED** by Elizabeth Lewis and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY**.

**XI. Aviation Noise News Update**

Steve Alverson provided a brief update on a few newsworthy items related to aircraft noise, including the continued delay of funding of the FAA Airport Improvement Program (AIP), the release of FAA guidance on solar installations near airports, and the Draft Caltrans Airport Land Use Compatibility Handbook is available for public review and comment.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: None.

**XII. Member Communications /Announcements**

None.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: None.

**XIII. Consideration / Approval / Presentation of a Resolution Recognizing Mark Church's Roundtable Service**

Roundtable Program manager, David F. Carbone, reviewed the service of Chairperson Mark Church during his 14 year association with the Roundtable, which included serving as Chairperson of the Roundtable for the past six years. David indicated that it has been a pleasure to work with Mark for all of those years and that Roundtable Staff appreciated Mark's leadership. David requested a motion for the approval of a resolution recognizing Mark's service to the Roundtable.

**Action:** Sepi Richardson **MOVED** approval of the Proposed Revision to the Roundtable Bylaws. The motion was **SECONDED** by Elizabeth Lewis and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY**.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: David F. Carbone presented the approved Resolution to Chairperson Church as well as gifts from the Roundtable including a desk clock and coffee table book of vintage travel posters. Several cards were presented as well. Vice Chairperson Rich Newman thanked Chairperson Church for his leadership on the Roundtable and wished him the best in his new position.

Chairperson Church indicated that he was really touched by the Resolution, gifts, and all of the kind words. He indicated that it has been truly an honor to serve as Roundtable's Chairperson for the past six years. He indicated that the work the Roundtable performs on behalf of the communities affected by noise from aircraft operating at SFO is invaluable. The positive working relationships the Roundtable has built with the Airport, Airlines, and Federal Aviation Administration will serve the community well for many years to come.

Chairperson Church personally thanked SFO's Airport Director, John Martin, for his unwavering support of the Roundtable's activities and for Mike McCarron serving as John's alternate on the

very few occasions John had intractable conflicts. He also thanked Bert Ganoung, David Ong, and Ara Balian in SFO's Aircraft Noise Abatement Office who spend countless hours listening to and investigating residents' noise concerns, working with the airlines to minimize their noise impacts, and providing a tremendous amount of support to the Roundtable.

Chairperson Church thanked the many Federal Aviation Administration personnel who have educated the Roundtable and area residents about the complex airspace in the San Francisco Bay Area and who have been extremely willing to address aircraft noise issues, while maintaining the safe and efficient operation of the national airspace system. In particular, Patty Daniel from the Northern California TRACON and Greg Kingery and Sean Cullilane from the SFO Air Traffic Control Tower have provided consistent and thoughtful support over many years.

Chairperson Church thanked the airlines who have worked with the Roundtable to minimize their noise exposure. He said their efforts are apparent by examining the diverse recipients of the Jon C. Long Fly Quiet Program Awards over the past several years. He added that is clear that the majority of the airlines at SFO are sincere about their noise control efforts, and thanked them for being willing participants in this effort.

Chairperson Church especially thanked Roundtable staff members David Carbone, Connie Shields, and Steve Alverson for the remarkable work they do behind the scenes to make the Roundtable run smoothly and for their valuable assistance to him in his role as Chairperson. He stated that the Roundtable is in good hands with David, Connie, and Steve's continued support.

Chairperson Church said that the community is the Roundtable's ultimate focus. Over the years, there have been many community members who have brought their concerns to the Roundtable meetings; however, one in particular, Rose Urbach, has been regularly attending Roundtable meetings from the very inception of the Roundtable. Rose's dedication is a testament to the community's interest in aircraft noise issues as well as their reliance on the Roundtable to do the best it can to address their concerns.

In closing, Chairperson Church thanked and praised his fellow Roundtable members for their collegial teamwork and their dedication to ensuring that the diverse interests on this often volatile topic are fully heard. He said the Roundtable is the nation's premiere community noise forum due to its members' collaborative spirit. He indicated that he would miss working with each of the members and wish them the best on their continued work on this important issue for the region.

#### **XIV. Adjourn**

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 8:56 PM.

(This page is left intentionally blank)