

**Airport / Community Roundtable
Meeting No. 265 Overview
Wednesday, October 7, 2009**

Item III.C

I. Call to Order / Roll Call / Declaration of Quorum Present

Mark Church, County of San Mateo Supervisor and Roundtable Chairperson, called the Regular Meeting of the Airport/Community Roundtable to order, at approximately 7:06 pm, in the David Chetcuti Community Room at Millbrae City Hall. Steve R. Alverson, Roundtable Coordinator called the roll. A quorum (at least 12 Regular Members) was present as follows:

Regular Members Present

John Martin, City and County of San Francisco Airport Commission
Mark Church, County of San Mateo Board of Supervisors/**Roundtable Chairperson**
Richard Newman, C/CAG Airport Land Use Committee (ALUC) and **Roundtable Vice-Chairperson**
Elizabeth Lewis, Town of Atherton
Sepi Richardson, City of Brisbane
Jerry Deal, City of Burlingame
David Canepa, City of Daly City
Naomi Patridge, City of Half Moon Bay
Marge Colapietro, City of Millbrae
Steve Toben, Town of Portola Valley
Jim Hartnett, City of Redwood City
City of San Bruno, Ken Ibarra
John Lee, City of San Mateo
David Burrow, Town of Woodside

Regular Members Absent

City and County of San Francisco Board of Supervisors
City and County of San Francisco Mayor's Office Representative
City of Belmont
City of Foster City
Town of Hillsborough
City of Menlo Park
City of Pacifica
City of San Carlos
City of South San Francisco

Advisory Members Present

None

Roundtable Staff / Consultants

Steve Alverson, Roundtable Coordinator

San Francisco International Airport Staff

Mike McCarron, Director, Bureau of Community Affairs
Bert Ganoung, Noise Abatement Manager
David Ong, Noise Abatement Systems Manager

Additional Technical Staff

Dennis Green and Patty Daniel, Northern California TRACON

Airport / Community Roundtable Meeting Overview

October 7, 2009

Page 2 of 10

Chairperson Church announced that David Carbone, Roundtable Program Manager, was not at the meeting due to his father's sudden passing and extended the Roundtable's deepest sympathies to David and his family.

II. Public Comments of Items Not on the Agenda

Comments/Concerns/Questions: None

III. Consent Agenda Items

- A. Review of Airport Director's Report for May 2009
- B. Review of Airport Director's Report for June 2009
- C. Review of Airport Director's Report for July 2009
- D. Review of Airport Director's Report for August 2009
- E. Review of a Roundtable Regular Meeting Overview for June 2009
- F. Review/Approval of Correspondence/Information Items for August/September/October 2009

Comments/Concerns/Questions: None

Action: Richard Newman **MOVED** the consent calendar items 3.A. through 3.F. The motion was **SECONDED** by David Canepa and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY.**

REGULAR AGENDA

IV. Airport Director's Comments

Comments/Concerns/Questions:

- Air traffic numbers are growing slightly year over year, so SFO is doing very well compared to the rest of the country.
- Most of that is growth by low-cost carriers which operate newer, quieter aircraft.
- There will be a bit of noise this weekend from the Blue Angels who based at SFO and are in town through Sunday. A lot of communities will be hearing noise from those aircraft.
- We continue to make an investment in upgrading our noise monitoring system.
- We are updating the Part 150 Noise Exposure map using that new system.
- We are continuing community outreach and continuing to also work with a "fly quiet" program, an important tool we use in working with carriers in trying to improve their performance and reducing noise impacts on the community.
- We've been working with the FAA on the Precision Runway Monitoring System for 12 years. The system will give us some additional relief on capacity with secondary noise benefits as well.
- We're continuing to really emphasize NextGen technology as a way of dealing with our capacity constraint we face in bad weather situations.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: None

V. Review of the new Roundtable Staff/Consultant Structure

- Environmental Science Associates (ESA) was selected as the consultant firm to provide Roundtable Coordinator support.
- Steve Alverson from ESA will serve as the Roundtable Coordinator. Dave Carbone will serve as the Roundtable Program Manager.
- A diagram in the packet shows the new structure.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: None

VI. Report on Roundtable Staff Visit to Los Angeles International Airport/Community Noise Roundtable Meeting

This item was continued to the next Regular Roundtable Meeting.

VII. Report on the Roundtable Representatives/Alternatives/Staff Visit to the FAA Northern California Air Traffic Control Facility (NorCal TRACON) with Representatives of the Oakland Airport – Community Noise Management Forum

- S. Alverson reported there were eight members from the Oakland Noise Forum and six from the Roundtable who met at Oakland International Airport and made the trip up I-80 to Rancho Cordova, California where the Northern California TRACON is located.
- The participants received a fantastic briefing and tour by Patty Daniel who is attending the meeting tonight. Patty gave the group a perspective of the size and scope of the area that the TRACON covers, from 23,000 feet down to handing aircraft off about ten miles from approach to each of the airports that are here in the Bay Area.

Comments/Concerns/Questions:

- Comments: Roundtable participants who went on the trip commented that they benefitted tremendously from the experience and highly recommend going on future trips to the TRACON. They also acknowledged that Patty Daniel did a great job in explaining everything in great detail and thanked her for her hospitality.

VIII. FY 2009 – 2010 Roundtable Work Program Items:

A. Consideration/Approval of a Roundtable Work Program for FY 2009/2010

- Dave Carbone prepared a report on the 2009-2010 Work Program (page 105 of the packet) and attached to the packet is the work program itself.
- The Work Program Subcommittee was unable to meet, due to scheduling conflicts, so staff put the report together for our review and consideration this evening.

Comments/Concerns/Questions:

Action: David Canepa **MOVED** approval of the 2009-2010 Work Program as presented. The motion was **SECONDED** by

Vice Chairperson Newman and **CARRIED,
UNANIMOUSLY.**

B. Southern San Mateo County Aircraft Noise Issues

1. Semi-Annual Report on the Crossing Altitude of the Oceanic Arrivals over the Woodside VOR (OSI)

- B. Ganoung presented the semi-annual report on the arrivals over the Woodside VOR.
- There are roughly 25 SFO flights a day over the Woodside VOR, or 5% of out 550 daily arrivals for SFO.
- The SFO flights have been on a gradual descent towards the 7000 ft from the previous 7300 ft for all hours due to a lot of vectoring.
- Some of the airlines have swapped out Boeing 777 for their Boeing 747 aircraft. The 777 does not descend as rapidly as the 747, so there are times when the controllers are bringing in the 777s at lower altitudes to ensure they intercept the glide slope at SFO at the proper location.

Comments/Concerns/Questions:

- Question: Bert, could you maybe give a little more depth and the causes of vectoring? Is it because of congestion or weather or any combination of those events?
- B. Ganoung: Yes, the answer is all of the above. If we have weather here at SFO or if flow control is used en route, then often times aircraft vectoring will be used.
- P. Daniel: If I could add just a couple of things, to what Bert said. The marine layer of fog that comes in that limits the number of airplanes we can get into SFO, so when we have more aircraft in trail, we do more vectoring at that time.
- Also, there has been a steady increase in oceanic-tailored arrivals, which will bring the oceanic arrivals in lower than 8000 feet over Woodside with the aircraft in a gliding configuration which is ideal for less fuel usage for the airlines, less air emissions for everybody underneath, and less noise. So we're in favor of the procedure.
- Vice Chairperson Newman: You're obviously not looking at the airplanes when they cross Woodside, but it's generally true with the oceanic-tailored arrival that crossing Woodside more often than not those airplanes would be clean, meaning no flaps, no gear, no speed brakes hanging.
- P. Daniel: That is the goal of the entire procedure.
- Vice Chairperson Newman: Hence, less noise.
- P. Daniel: Correct.
- S. Richardson: The noise we are hearing in Brisbane is tremendous. I was up last night –this morning, 2:30 in the morning- we had flights over Brisbane, so low, so loud, I think the changes are tremendous. There has to be some sort of review of some of these practices or increased use. It's really troublesome.

- P. Daniel: Okay, Bert's office can check the flights and we can see what's causing that.
- Comment Richardson: I'd appreciate that.
- Comment: Patty, is there any plan that has been formulated that we can review on the sequence for implementing OTA? The last information we've had was that there wasn't any systematic design that would inform us on the way that this would be brought online. I have concerns about whether enough environmental impact analyses have been done to justify this, given the potential significant impacts that could happen.
- P. Daniel: This is one of the first steps of NextGen, a procedure that's being tested and we're the first place to test it, but I can tell you that environmental information is being collected on every flight.
- Comment: But there is some noise data that Boeing is collecting on that?
- P. Daniel: Yes, because that's important to them, that they know that they are achieving reduced air emissions, reduced noise, and reduced fuel burn
- B. Ganoung: We have the Boeing noise data. We're trying to take the raw data and present it to you in a CNEL format.
- Comment: Do you have an expectation as to when that data might be presented to the Roundtable?
- B. Ganoung: I'm ready to do it at the December meeting.

2. Consideration of a September 3, 2009 Request from Roundtable Representatives of Towns of Woodside, Atherton and Portola Valley

- B. Ganoung: Per the request to the Roundtable to ask the SFO Noise Abatement office to allocate resources to investigate and respond, the South County Representatives and constituents regarding:
 - a. Q: Any changes in flight paths over in South San Mateo County.
A: Since we've started this in 2004, there have been no changes.
 - b. Q: Any changes in procedures impacting aircraft noise over South San Mateo County.
A: The only change that I'm aware of is the OTA and in such, we've made that public. It's not a published procedure yet, but we are testing it.
 - c. Q: Explanation of median arrival altitudes well below the 8,000 ft target
A: I believe we've explained that a considerable amount of times and we've explained it again this evening. So the Airport believes it has covered this item sufficiently.
 - d. Q: Plans to address any lack of compliance with established procedures
A: Well, the way that the NCT's procedures manual basically states it is: Traffic permitting, they'll try to overfly at 8000

feet, and that is, to the best of my knowledge, being done by Patty and her group. They're doing very well at it.

Comments/Concerns/Questions:

- Comment: A member of the public Mr. Lyons expressed concern about the increase in traffic over his home which is at a 2,300 ft elevation, so if a commercial aircraft comes over at 6000 feet, that's less than 4000 feet from my house. He also expressed his concern about a noticeable increase in private aircraft over our house and Skyline Blvd above Woodside.
- Comment: A member of the public Nate McKitterick, from the Town of Portola Valley, thanked the Airport and FAA for their effort. He also spoke in support of the proposal that's been put before the Roundtable this evening. He affirmed that the Airport's presentation indicated that there has been a decrease in altitudes, of flights over his community, there's been an increase in the number of flights over his community with the average altitude of those flights is just above 6000 ft, which is considerably less than the 8000 ft that was agreed to by the FAA about a decade ago.
- The Anna Eshoo letter was written in 2005 and this is 4 years later and so many things have changed relative to incoming/outgoing altitudes, the types of aircraft, and the new way aircraft are built. So much has happened in the airline industry, we need to keep that in mind when we're considering these requests and solutions to them.

3. Roundtable Member Communication Protocol with Roundtable Staff and SFO Noise Abatement Office Staff

- Concerns have been expressed to the Chair about the manner in which specific requests are made of staff. Specifically concerns were expressed that individual requests affecting certain communities requiring research and time from Airport Staff should be either brought back to the Roundtable as a whole or should be funneled through the Roundtable Chair to be handled in his/her discretion.
- Requests of Staff or of the Airport should be funneled through the Chair.
- We can't just arbitrarily and even capriciously demand that Airport Staff do sometimes massive volumes of work as well as the FAA. The work that they do and the way they do it might not satisfy some individuals. If that exists then it should come before the Roundtable and not to those departments.
- The success of the Roundtable is that despite its varied members and interests Roundtable has fostered positive exchange of ideas and we talked about our differences in a very polite and civil manner. It's not fair to play this game about South County - North County and so forth. Some of the problems are unique to the southern part of the County

but we should not try to solve the problem by dedicating resources to one area and not the rest.

- Roundtable Staff has prepared a report on this item (page 127) in the packet). Staff has indicated that the Roundtable actually has no formal protocols established for member communications in our bylaws and so it may be appropriate that we have some revision to our bylaws to reflect appropriate protocol for communications with airport staff.
- We should clarify the way that work gets metered to the staff, and all of our correspondence from the South County over the years, we've always copied the Chair, and we've always copied staff, and our assumption was that if there was a work flow blockage of some kind that there would be some scheduling –we would certainly accommodate. Clarifying this protocol in a way that puts the responsibility on either the Chair or the Roundtable Coordinator to get back to the requestor regarding the level of effort to respond to the request.
- If there's a prime directive for this committee it is that we will not attempt to move noise to another city. The "8000 ft level" is not a standard it's a guideline. A resolution from this Roundtable would be enough rather than to write it into the bylaw. We can't write everything into the bylaws, but if that's the only way we can get it there then I would support that as well. Thank you.
- Significant requests for information for action be directed to the Chair, with a copy for the Staff so everybody can see what has been requested
- The Bylaws Committee should reconvene and take all of these suggestions that have been made and come back with a recommended protocol as to how to handle requests for information, research, whatever it may be.
- Suggestion was made that it might be good for the Chair to acknowledge receipt of the inquiry by return communication and possibly discuss with Staff who is responsible to provide the information to provide an approximate timeline they feel that they may be able to address the issue.

4. Next Steps

- We also need to address the issue of when a Subcommittee sunsets. In the past Subcommittees have sunset when the final report was given. I don't think the South County Woodside VOR Subcommittee has met for awhile since that report, this request came from individual members so it's not really an official request from the committee.
- There hasn't been a Woodside VOR Sub Committee Meeting- for three years. This was simply a request from three communities in the South County.
- The Bylaws Sub Committee will be, at a minimum. The Chair and the Vice Chairperson and anyone else who wishes to serve. David Burow and Marge Colapietro have volunteered to join the Bylaws Subcommittee.

Action: A motion to have the Bylaws Subcommittee meet to update the Bylaws to develop communications protocols was **MOVED, SECONDED, and CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY.**

C. Review of the Fly Quiet Program Quarterly Report

- Bert Ganoung presented the Quarterly Fly Quiet Report.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: None

D. Status Report on the Fly Quiet Program Video Project

- A great deal of progress has been made since we had our last meeting. A lot of video has been shot and the following email from Bryan Kingston, the videographer Roundtable Staff and Airport Staff regarding the status of the video:

“The majority of the B-roll images and all of the interviews have been captured. We have logged and reviewed these items and prepared them for the edit. We are awaiting the animations and look forward to plugging them into the video. As you know, we originally hoped to have a finished product for your October 7th meeting, but unfortunately for a variety of reasons we will have to adjust our timeline. I will be away from the office from October 1st-20th. We would like to target mid-November for an edit review, with a finished product for debut at your December 2nd Community Roundtable meeting. This timeline is contingent upon receipt of the animations, which are critical building blocks for the finished product. We will be in good shape if we have our hands on them by Friday, October 23rd or thereabouts. Thank you for all your assistance to date. We appreciate your patience, and look forward to unveiling a strong and compelling product in December.”

- Assuming Bert is able to get the animations to Bryan by 10/23, and Bryan is able to incorporate them, the Roundtable should be able to see the Fly Quiet Video at the 12/2 meeting.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: None

E. AIP Funding Reauthorization for FY 2010

- AIP is the source of which funding comes to airports for them to get things like the noise monitoring system that SFO has as well as going out to the FAA for other types of projects like NextGen that Patty mentioned in her presentation to improve ATC and to get those nice noise abatement tracks that we're all looking for, as well as Land Use and Noise Compatibility studies such as the FAR Part 150 studies.
- There is hope that there will be a two or three year AIP improvement program funding reauthorization at the beginning of 2010.

Comments/Concerns/Questions:

- Q: How much money would be in the reauthorization?
- A: The nationwide funding is typically in the range of about \$3-4 billion per year. Right now the way that it's written it's going to be about \$3.5 billion dollars per year for the next 2-3 years. The actual need is probably in the \$6-8 billion range on a yearly basis but the funds are typically used, at least the funds that aren't allocated are used to help make the federal budget look a little more balanced than it really is.
- Q: Is there any stimulus money involved in this?
- A: We recently received about \$15-\$16 million in stimulus funding, mainly for some runway work and for some baggage security systems.

F. Update on the FAA/NASA/SFO Study on Oceanic Tailored Arrivals (OTA) to SFO

Continued to the December 2009 Regular Meeting.

G. Status report on the update of the SFO Airport Land Use Compatibility Plan (CLUP)

Continued to the December 2009 Regular Meeting.

H. Consideration/Approval of Roundtable Budget for Fiscal Year 2009/2010

- The Airport contributes \$125,000 of annual funding. All of the member cities contribute \$1,500 each, the County contributes \$12,000, and the Airport Land Use Commission (C/CAG) \$1,500.
- The County is reimbursed for Dave Carbone's time and that will be approximately \$34,000. The other staff items are listed there, the Roundtable Coordinator, \$60,000 and the Admin Assistant, \$25,000. The \$600 in the budget includes the continuation of the media consultant contract; that is \$20,000 annually allocated for this 2009/2010 budget. It is \$13,306 and there is a slight increase in some of the administrative expenses.

Comments/Concerns/Questions:

- There is not a line item for travel expenses, yet Dave Carbone travels for Roundtable purposes from time to time. Since Dave is not here, it's not a question that needs to be answered tonight, but it should be answered in the future.

Action: A motion to approve the 2009/2010 Roundtable Budget was **MOVED, SECONDED, and CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY.**

IX. Review of Roundtable Accomplishments

This item pulled due to death in David F. Carbone's family. This item will be posted in the next agenda.

Airport / Community Roundtable Meeting Overview

October 7, 2009

Page 10 of 10

Comments/Concerns/Questions: None.

X. Member Communications and Announcements

- Chairperson Church: On behalf of the Roundtable, I want to thank Patty Daniel and Dennis Green for coming down here from Sacramento to be with us this evening and to answer questions, thank you very much. I also want to thank Jim Hartnett for his long distinguished career in public service and your service on this body. I've served with Jim on a number of agencies and it has been an absolute pleasure Jim, thank you so much for all that you've done.
- B. Ganoung: The Aircraft Noise Abatement office is moving due to the Terminal 2 construction. There will be no phone or email changes. Richard Flaa, who used to be with our staff, has left and gone over to Airfield Operations so he's becoming an Airfield Safety Officer. Gail Van Sciver has been reassigned to Finance. We have another fully-capable secretary, Joyce Sato, who is now with our office.

Comments/Concerns/Questions: None

XI. Adjourn

- Chairperson Church: I would like to ask that we adjourn this evening in memory of Dave Carbone's father, and our condolences go out to Dave and his family. This meeting is adjourned.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 8:30 PM.