

**AIRPORT / COMMUNITY ROUNDTABLE
MEETING OVERVIEW**

Meeting No: 248
Wednesday, September 6, 2006

1. Call to Order, Roll Call

Mark Church, San Mateo County Supervisor and Roundtable Chairperson, called the Regular Meeting of the Airport/Community Roundtable to order, at approximately 7:05 p.m. in the David Chetcuti Community Room, at the Millbrae City Hall in Millbrae, California. Dave Carbone, Roundtable Coordinator, called the roll. A quorum (at least 12 Regular Members) was present, as follows:

Regular Members Present

Jack Barry, City and County of San Francisco Mayor's Office Representative
Michael McCarron, City and County of San Francisco Airport Commission
Mark Church, San Mateo County Supervisor and Roundtable Chairperson
Richard Newman, C/CAG Airport Land Use Committee (ALUC) / Roundtable Vice Chairperson
Ann Keighran, City of Burlingame
Judith Christensen, City of Daly City
Naomi Patridge, City of Half Moon Bay
Christine Krolik, Town of Hillsborough
Lee Duboc, City of Menlo Park
Linda Larson, City of Millbrae
Sue Digre, City of Pacifica
Steve Toben, Town of Portola Valley
Alicia Aguirre, City of Redwood City
Ken Ibarra, City of San Bruno
John Lee, City of San Mateo
Mark Addiego, City of South San Francisco

Regular Members Absent

City and County of San Francisco Board of Supervisors (Vacant)
Town of Atherton
City of Belmont
City of Brisbane
City of Foster City
City of San Carlos
Town of Woodside

Advisory Members Present

Greg Kingery, SFO Air Traffic Control Tower

Roundtable Staff / Consultants

David F. Carbone, Senior Planner, County of San Mateo / Roundtable Coordinator
Heather R. Hoshii, Assistant Roundtable Coordinator / Consultant
Walter Gillfillan, Roundtable Project Manager / Consultant

San Francisco International Airport Staff

Bert Ganoung, Noise Abatement Manager
David Ong, Sr. Noise Abatement Specialist
Richard Flaa, Noise Abatement Intern

2. Public Comment of Items Not on the Agenda

Comments / Concerns / Questions:

- Rose Urbach, City of San Bruno resident, noted her issue as being low flying airplanes. She emphasized the Roundtable should focus on noise and low flying aircraft.

3. Consent Agenda Items

- Review of Airport Director's Report for July 2006**
- Approval of Roundtable Meeting Overview for August 2006**
- Review of Correspondence / Informational Items for September 2006**

ACTION: Alicia Aguirre **MOVED** approval of Consent Agenda Items 3.a – 3.c. The motion was **SECONDED** by Steve Toben and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY**.

REGULAR AGENDA

4. Monthly Airport Director's Report

Comments / Concerns / Questions:

- The Noise Abatement Office is in the process of seeking funds via an FAA grant to expand the noise monitoring system to include more monitors
- The SOIA/PRM system, which allows the airport better arrival rates during inclement weather, is now back in service after approximately three (3) months, during which it was taken out of service for various maintenance issues and upgrades
- The Airport Noise Office has been working with NASA AMES to prepare a test of the Oceanic Tailored Arrival (OTA) Procedure
- The Noise Abatement Office has now started to deploy the portable noise monitors after a five (5) year hiatus
- The Noise Abatement Office will soon be hiring to fill two (2) vacancies in their office
- Bert Ganoung will be speaking at the NASA Airport Planning Conference on the 12th and 13th of September

5. Roundtable Work Program Items:

- Consideration / Approval of Recommendations from the Woodside VOR (OSI) Subcommittee, Re: On-going Actions to Monitor Compliance with the Specified Crossing Altitude for Oceanic Jet Arrivals Over the Woodside VOR (OSI)**

Woodside VOR (OSI) Subcommittee Chair Steve Toben provided the following background on this item:

- In 2000 a negotiation took place resulting in an understanding that conditions permitting, aircraft flying over the Woodside VOR (OSI) would arrive at or above 8000 feet MSL
- Starting in late 2003, early 2004, there was a decline in the number of aircraft crossing OSI at or above 8000 feet MSL
- In early 2004 the SFO Noise Abatement Office began to step up the monitoring of traffic over the Woodside VOR (OSI) and began requesting attention to this issue from NORCAL TRACON
- A particular concern to the community has been arrivals between the period of 10:30 pm and 6:00 am
- The Woodside VOR (OSI) Subcommittee, in its draft report has proposed six recommendations
- The scope of the OSI crossing altitude was in question regarding the term "Oceanic" and whether aircraft arriving via the Big Sur or the Point Reyes arrival were to be encompassed in the OSI procedure or if the procedure was strictly meant to cover aircraft arriving from over the ocean (ie. from Hawaii or the Orient)
- The Subcommittee acknowledges that the Subcommittee and the Roundtable does not have the authority to resolve the issue on the scope of the OSI altitude crossing procedure
- NORCAL TRACON has indicated that it is problematic to have Oakland Airport traffic cross OSI at or above 8000' due to the abundance of traffic in the area
- Patty Daniel of NORCAL TRACON contacted Dave Carbone and indicated that recommendation #6 would not be feasible at this time due to staffing schedules and staffing levels

Comments / Questions / Concerns:

- Why are aircraft flying at upwards of 8000 feet over peoples homes near Portola Valley more of an issue than those flying over homes in the San Bruno area at 3000 feet
- The area of Woodside has low ambient noise ranging on average of 31dB-35dB and as a result the noise generated by aircraft over flights disrupts a much quieter area
- Areas and cities near the Airport would love to have aircraft flying that high
- Regarding the Subcommittees recommendation # 1, 5 and 6 special reports and attention regarding noise issues should not be generated for some cities and not others
- The responsibility should be put on the individual cities to request the additional reports periodically and it should not be written in stone that the Roundtable automatically gets reports regarding the OSI because it singles out one area
- Flying is an art and trying to make something that requires human intuition into a dead on science is a dangerous thing to do
- The Tailored Oceanic Arrival currently being worked on will be a solution to not only Portola Valley's problem but every city between OSI and the touch down point at SFO
- Recommendation #3 should not be included due to the fact that it deals with Oakland Airport traffic and not San Francisco Airport traffic
- The Oakland Airport does not hold a position on the Roundtable and the Roundtable should not take on issues outside its sphere of influence
- The Roundtable should not interfere in the working relationship between NORCAL TRACON and the SFO Noise Abatement Office
- Recommendation #6 could become a bureaucratic nightmare
- The term "non-compliance" implies that a law exists when in fact the 8,000 foot altitude is a guideline
- The overall goal is to reduce noise and create a quieter environment and therefore, we should not be concerned about specific altitudes and flight patterns

- With technology it might be possible for aircraft to operate more quietly at a lower altitudes
- Aircraft have become progressively quieter, since the 8,000 foot crossing altitude was established back in 2000 and these guidelines may be out of date
- The word "standard" isn't used appropriately; the 8,000 feet is a guideline more than a standard
- Recommendation #5 and #6 imply that the Roundtable is looking to place blame and therefore, should not be included
- NORCAL TRACON staff and in particular Patty Daniel have been very cooperative and helpful during this whole process
- The six recommendations from the subcommittee are only requests and we should shy away from the strong language so that no one feels pressured
- The SFO Noise Abatement Office has been under staffed for almost 4 years and the report requests from the Roundtable have been accommodated and they will continue to be

ACTION: Richard Newman **MOVED** approval of Agenda Item 5.a. as follows: Recommendations 1, 2, 4, and 5 are acceptable as is, while Recommendation 3 and 6 will be taken under advisement, undergo substantial revisions and be resubmitted to the Roundtable for approval at a later date. The motion was **SECONDED** by John Lee and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY**.

b. Review of Issues Related to Noise Monitoring Sites

Comments / Questions / Concerns:

- Noise monitoring site installation upgrade began in the fourth quarter of 2004
- In 2004, two (2) noise monitoring sites were installed
- It was discovered that the noise monitor mast provided by the vendor was of poor quality and until it was fixed installation of further noise monitors was halted
- During the calendar year 2005, 17 noise monitoring sites were completed
- Site installation was again halted due to poor quality of work and performance of the vendors subcontractors
- To date, in 2006, three (3) noise monitoring sites have been completed
- A total of 22 noise monitoring sites have been installed
- Site # 15 was the only noise monitor that was relocated
- Monitor # 15 was relocated 0.8 miles northeast of its original location to allow for better noise data gathering capabilities
- There are seven (7) more sites to be installed (#7 – Brisbane, #8 – Millbrae, #19 – Pacifica, #1 – San Bruno, #29 – San Mateo, #6 – South San Francisco, and # 14 – South San Francisco)
- The remaining seven sites have a few logistical issues delaying the installation process
- Problems with permitting, establishing PG&E service, site location and subcontractor availability are all reasons for the installation delays

c. Consideration / Approval of the Foster City Fly Quiet Rating Addition to the Fly Quiet Program Report

Comments/Questions/Concerns:

- The Foster City Fly Quiet Program rating criteria was presented to the Roundtable during the August 2006 meeting
- The intent of this item is to have the Roundtable take formal action to approve the rating criteria as an addition to the Fly Quiet Program

ACTION: Christine Krolik **MOVED** approval of Agenda Item 5.c. The motion was **SECONDED** by Richard Newman and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY**.

d. Update on the September 2006 N.O.I.S.E. Conference in Burlingame

Comments/Questions/Concerns:

- The conference will be held September 20-22, 2006 at the Doubletree Hotel in Burlingame
- At the conference there will be a senior staff member from the FAA Community and Environmental Needs Division in the Office of Airport Planning and Programming speaking
- A representative from Boeing will be at the conference giving a presentation on the B-787 Dreamliner
- In attendance will be several members of the Australian Mayoral Aviation Council
- The new chief of the California Transportation Division of Aeronautics will also be speaking at the conference regarding State noise standards

6. Consideration / Approval of an Amendment to the 2006-2007 Work Program, Re: Semi Annual Reports on Woodside VOR Crossing Altitudes for Oceanic Jet Arrivals

Comments/Questions/Concerns:

NONE

ACTION: Naomi Patridge **MOVED** approval of Agenda Item 6. The motion was **SECONDED** by Judith Christensen and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY**.

7. Semi-Annual Report on Woodside VOR Crossing Altitudes for Oceanic Jet Arrivals

Comments/Questions/Concerns:

- The critical hours for the citizens near the Woodside VOR are between 10:30 p.m. and 6:30 a.m.
- Early in 2004, Woodside VOR crossing altitudes of SFO bound aircraft between the hours of 10:30 p.m. and 6:30 a.m. averaged around 7400 feet
- Since July of 2004, the average crossing altitudes have begun to steadily increase
- In May of 2006, the crossing altitude of aircraft inbound to SFO over the Woodside VOR between the hours of 10:30 p.m. and 6:30 a.m. averaged above 8000 feet

8. Consideration / Approval of a Draft Letter to the FAA Administrator, Re: Comments of the Final Update of FAA Order 5050.4B, National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) Implementing Instructions for Airport Actions

Comments / Questions / Concerns:

- The Roundtable submitted a previous letter on the draft language of the update of FAA Order 5050.4B, but none of the Roundtable's comments from that letter were included in the final version of the Order
- The purpose of this letter isn't to request the FAA change an order that has already been issued but it is more to share the Roundtable's opinion about the order with those that will be copied, re: The lack of the FAA's acknowledgment of the Roundtable's concerns and comments

ACTION: Richard Newman **MOVED** approval of Agenda Item 8. The motion was **SECONDED** by Alicia Aguirre and **CARRIED, UNANIMOUSLY**.

9. Member Communications / Announcements

Comments/Questions/Concerns:

- The time and efforts of the Noise Abatement and Roundtable Staff are greatly appreciated
- SFO just received 1.4 million from the FAA to upgrade the runway lights and do some airfield repaving

10. ADJOURN

Meeting adjourned at approximately 8:50 pm